Asesiad o Les Lleol Abertawe 2022

Atodiad 2: Adroddiad ar yr Adborth o'r Ymgynghoriad

1. Cyflwyniad

- 1.1. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn amlinellu'r ymgynghoriad ar fersiwn ddrafft Asesiad o Les Lleol 2022 Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Abertawe, yr adborth a dderbyniwyd yn ystod cyfnod ymgynghori ac ymateb arfaethedig y Bwrdd.
- 1.2. Cynhaliwyd yr ymgynghoriad rhwng 22 Chwefror a 18 Mawrth 2022. Cafodd ymatebwyr eu hannog i gwblhau'r arolwg ar-lein neu roeddent yn gallu cyflwyno sylwadau ac awgrymiadau ar yr asesiad (yn gyfan neu rannau penodol ohono) drwy e-bost neu'r post. Tua diwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori (15 Mawrth), anfonwyd e-byst atgoffa i bawb y cysylltwyd â hwy'n wreiddiol.
- 1.3. Hyrwyddwyd yr ymgynghoriad ar yr asesiad drwy:
 - Ymgyngoreion statudol, fel y'u rhestrir o dan Ddeddf Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol (Cymru) 2015
 - Sefydliadau eraill, gan gynnwys y rheini sydd ar y rhestr cylchredeg ar gyfer partneriaeth y Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (BGC)
 - Anogwyd yr uchod hefyd i gylchredeg yr ymgynghoriad i unrhyw gysylltiadau a rhwydweithiau perthnasol
 - Datganiad i'r wasg a gwefan Cyngor Abertawe Tudalennau 'Newyddion' a 'Dweud eich dweud' (ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus)
 - Cyfrifon cyfryngau cymdeithasol Cyngor Abertawe: Facebook a Twitter (ar 23 Chwefror, 12 Mawrth a 17 Mawrth)
 - Cyfryngau lleol (e.e. eitem yn yr *Evening Post*, 24 Chwefror 2022).
- 1.4. Mae adran 2 o'r adroddiad hwn yn cynnwys amserlen o adborth o'r arolwg ymgynghori, yn gyffredinol a thrwy bennod asesu, ynghyd ag ymateb arfaethedig y Bwrdd ym mhob achos. Mae'r ymatebion ar wahân a gafwyd gan sefydliadau hefyd i'w gweld yn Atodiadau 2-4 o'r adroddiad hwn:
 - Atodiad 1 Holiadur ar gyfer Ymgynghoriad Drafft a Chrynodeb o Ganlyniadau
 - Atodiad 2 Ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru
 - Atodiad 3 Ymateb Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol
 - Atodiad 4 Ymateb Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru.

2. Adborth ac Ymatebion

Mae Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Abertawe wedi ymrwymo i'r egwyddorion cenedlaethol ar gyfer Ymgysylltu â'r Cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Mae hwn yn argymell y dwedir wrth bobl am effaith eu cyfraniad.

Mae'r tabl isod yn dangos sut mae Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (BGC) Abertawe wedi ymateb i'r adborth a gafwyd o'r ymgynghoriad ar yr Asesiad o Les Lleol drafft ar gyfer 2022. Ystyriwyd pob cynnig mewn cyfarfodydd o'r Grŵp Golygyddol Asesu ym mis Mawrth-Ebrill 2022 gydag arweinwyr y penodau unigol a chynrychiolwyr aelodau statudol y BGC.

Caiff yr ymatebion i'r adborth eu categoreiddio mewn hyd at dair ffordd, gyda'r ymateb a sylwadau ychwanegol yn y golofn ar y dde:

- D: Mae'r Asesiad Drafft wedi'i ddiwygio
- DN: ar ôl ystyriaeth, does dim newid
- C: Cyfeiriwyd at y Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i'w ystyried, fel rhan o'r gwaith o baratoi'r Cynllun Lles Lleol yn 2022/23.

Cyfeiriad / Pennod / Sylw	O ble daeth hyn?	Ymateb
C1) Cyffredinol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd	D/C
	Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	
We note the academic research commissioned to	Cymru (t3)	Ni fydd canfyddiadau'r ymchwil hon yn cael eu
highlight the key implications and messages (the 'so		cynnwys yn yr asesiad hwn ond cânt eu cyhoeddi
what') from the draft well-being assessment. While		mewn adroddiad ar wahân. Defnyddir y comisiwn
this is positive to hear, it's not clear from the		ymchwil i lywio'r camau nesaf tuag at y cynllun lles.
information set out if these findings would be included		Bydd testun yr asesiad yn cael ei ddiwygio i egluro
in the final well-being assessment, or if this is intended		hyn.
as information aimed at PSB members to help inform		
next steps as attention shifts to the well-being plan?		
Clarity on this within the assessment would be helpful.		
C2) Cyffredinol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd	D/C
	Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	
Involvement – Building on your positive work to date,	Cymru (t3)	
we encourage you to consider including further		
information (and reflection) on the following:		

 What you consider to be the strengths and challenges of your engagement work to date. Identifying the 'seldom heard voices' you are seeking to involve. Any approaches or tools you've identified that could potentially improve your work to involve people going forward. Using and including quotes from residents within the assessment (we note annex 1 states these will be included in the final published assessment). 		 D. Byddwn yn ystyried ehangu ar hyn o fewn Atodiad ychwanegol – 'Cefndir yr Asesiad'. D. Byddwn yn ystyried egluro fel rhan o Atodiad ychwanegol – 'Cefndir yr Asesiad'. C. I'w ystyried fel rhan o broses y Cynllun Lles lle mae cyfranogaeth yn elfen fwy canolog. D. Ychwanegwyd dyfyniadau o'r arolwg cyhoeddus at benodau o'r asesiad terfynol.
C3) Cyffredinol Future Trends – we recommend full consideration is given to the <u>Future Trends Report</u> (published in December 2021) to help better inform and strengthen the assessment. This should be carried out in relation to and across all four dimensions of well-being. It would also be helpful to understand how the PSB intends to continue to consider and embed future trends information into its next steps, including the development of a well-being plan and setting of objectives and steps. Futures techniques are effective tools for engaging with others and prompting constructive discussion in a way that can help develop plans that deliver meaningful change.	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol Cymru (t4)	C / D Mae gwybodaeth o'r adroddiad Tueddiadau'r Dyfodol wedi llywio agweddau ar yr asesiad hwn, er nid mewn modd mor gynhwysfawr ag y byddem wedi hoffi oherwydd adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn cydnabod bod hyn yn broblem ac rydym yn ymrwymedig i ystyried tueddiadau'r dyfodol yn llawnach yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles. Diwygiwyd y tudalennau Cyflwyno yn yr asesiad terfynol i adlewyrchu hyn.
C4) Penodau cyffredinol / lluosog We acknowledge the assessment highlights existing gaps. Building on the positive work undertaken to	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol Cymru (t6)	

date, we recommend:		
• Ensuring all 'protected characteristics' outlined in		• DN. Mae'r nodweddion gwarchodedig a
the Equality Act are considered within the assessment.		amlinellwyd yn y Ddeddf Cydraddoldeb wedi'u
• Some consideration is given to how intersectionality		hystyried cyn belled ag y bo modd, yn arbennig o
affects people in the area. For example, what is like to		fewn y penodau Lles Cymdeithasol a Phroffil
be young and LGBTQ+ in Swansea? We note in the		Abertawe.
'Listening to young people' section, children and young		• DN. Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth
people highlighted 'Equality for LGBTQ+ children and		bellach oherwydd cyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser.
young people' as a key issue.		• C. Rydym yn cydnabod hyn fel mater ac yn
 Making the links to your engagement work on 		ymrwymedig i ymgysylltu'n llawnach â lleisiau nas
engaging with seldom heard voices, as this develops.		clywir yn aml yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles.
We also encourage you to consider the implications of		Adroddiad 'Anghydraddoldeb yng Nghymru'r
our recent ' <u>Inequality in a future Wales</u> ' report. This		Dyfodol' – DN / C. Nodwyd y sylw, ond ar hyn o
highlights the how future of work, changing		bryd, mae cyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser yn
demographics and climate change could increase		cyfyngu ar unrhyw ystyried bellach. Fodd bynnag,
existing inequalities if the impacts on different groups		caiff yr adroddiad ei ystyried fel adnodd i lywio
in society are not factored in.		proses y Cynllun Lles.
C5) Penodau cyffredinol / lluosog	Swyddfa Comisiynydd	
	Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	
Understanding the full definition of Wales' well-being	Cymru (t6-7)	Y Gymraeg – C. I'w hystyried yn rhan o broses y
goals can help ensure the assessment is considering		Cynllun Lles.
the wide range of topics and themes of well-being		
within your area. The below sets out areas that could		Caffael teg a lleol – D. Mae gwybodaeth am gaffael
be explored further within the assessment, and/or		a'r fenter Y Tu Hwnt i Frics a Morter wedi'i
taken into consideration for the well-being plan.		hychwanegu at bennod Yr Economi (adran Sylfaen
It is appreciated that it may not be possible for all the		Busnes). Mae gwybodaeth yng nghyflwyniad pennod
information below to be fully considered /		yr Economi am ddod o hyd i bethau'n lleol a chefnogi
incorporated in your assessment. Instead, you may		cwmnïau lleol ar gaffael
wish to choose some areas to compliment the		

extensive work you have already undertaken:		Brexit – D. Mae cyfeiriad at Brexit a'i effeithiau
Welsh Language – As the PSB's attention shifts to the		wedi'i ychwanegu at gyflwyniad pennod yr Economi.
well-being plan, we recommend clear links are made		
to your local authority's promotional strategy and your		Partneriaeth Sgiliau Rhanbarthol – D.
relevant Welsh in Education Strategic Plan (WESP).		Ychwanegwyd cyfeiriad yng nghyd-destun y prosiect
Fair and local procurement – Our bitesize resource on		Sgiliau a Thalent.
procurement provides a helpful summary on the		
Commissioner's vision for procurement, identifying		
the key issues highlighted by public bodies during the		
research and Section 20 Review, as well as the		
recommendations outlined in our 'Procuring well-		
being in Wales' report.		
Brexit – Likely to have an impact for Swansea and its		
residents, e.g., EU citizens residing in the city, the		
ability of businesses to import and export goods, and		
sectors such as tourism and the creative industries		
that have relied on free movement of people. The		
WCPP's briefing: ' <u>The impacts of Covid-19 and Brexit</u>		
on well-being' is a helpful resource on this.		
Regional Skills Partnership – It's not clear if the links		
have been made with your local Regional Skills		
Partnership. Your assessment will be a significant		
resource for them. Similarly, their strategies and		
priorities will be key for your PSB. Please also see		
above points on skills for the future.		
C6) Cyffredinol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd	C/D
	Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	
Localised data: The draft assessment provides some	Cymru (t7)	Mae'r anhawster o wneud hyn yn gyson drwy'r
breakdown of data to smaller geographies within		asesiad yn glir, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach
Swansea, but this could be more consistent through		gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser. Fodd bynnag,

the document (where possible to do so). Comparison of different areas can be helpful to highlight local inequalities, any best practice from programmes delivered at a local level, and to identify where targeted interventions may be required.		bydd proffiliau ystadegol o'r Ardaloedd Cymunedol yn cael eu darparu mewn Atodiad (fel yn 2017) i dynnu sylw at nodweddion a gwahaniaethau sylfaenol yn yr ardaloedd, gydag ystadegau allweddol ar gyfer pob ardal hefyd wedi'u nodi yn y bennod 'Proffil Abertawe'.
C7) Penodau cyffredinol / lluosog	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	D
Integration: A strong feature of the assessment which recognises many issues are inter-connected. Structuring a well-being assessment by well-being dimension does works well but there are some sections where clearer links could be made to other areas/chapters of the assessment. For example, the chapter on poverty is extensive and includes fuel and food poverty, and further links could be made here to the environment and economy chapters. Similarly, while integration is discussed in relation to digital connectivity where it states: "there are also links to aspects of the social chapter, including housing and poverty", it would be helpful in examples like this if some further information/context could be provided on how this is the case.	Cymru (t7)	Mae agweddau integreiddio'r asesiad terfynol wedi'u hamlygu ac adeiladwyd arnynt lle y bu modd. Bydd yr agwedd hon hefyd yn rhan allweddol o'r comisiwn ymchwil academaidd, fel y nodwyd yn y Cyflwyniad.
C8) Cyffredinol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	D
Collaboration : Building on the collaborative approach taken to developing the assessment in the region, it would be beneficial if the assessment identified who all the partners were and how the collaboration was	Cymru (t7)	Byddwn yn ystyried cynnwys yr wybodaeth hon mewn atodiad 'Cefndir' newydd i'r prif asesiad, ynghyd â manylion pellach ynghylch agweddau ar y broses gyffredinol (fel y gwnaed yn 2017).

managed. This information would help for future learning, as cross-sector collaboration is a challenging but often effective means of delivering social change.	Sundafa Camiainanda	D
C9) Cyffredinol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	U
The 'economy' chapter finishes with a section on 'Overall Conclusions'. For consistency, you may wish to include a similar section in the other three main chapters.	Cymru (t8)	Diwygiwyd cyflwyniad pennod yr Economi ychydig fel ei fod yn cyd-fynd yn fwy â phenodau dimensiynau eraill.
C10) Cyffredinol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	D
Links to the sub-topics where they are listed in the introductory chapter would be beneficial and increase navigability.	Cymru (t8)	Byddwn yn ystyried ychwanegu dolenni at gyflwyniadau pob un o'r penodau sy'n seiliedig ar ddimensiwn.
C11) Cyffredinol / Cyflwyniad	Llywodraeth Cymru (t2 & p6)	C / D
Statutory Requirements – The assessment is based around the same six community areas that were used in the 2017 well-being assessment. The introduction briefly sets out the community areas and they are occasionally referenced in parts of the assessment; however, we would like to see a lot more analysis broken down by these areas throughout the analysis and any differences or similarities between the community areas highlighted. By assessing the well- being of each community, it gives a better understanding of the diversity of the PSB area, and how the varying characteristics of each community impact on well-being, which in turn, helps determine the priorities. It would also be useful to include more		Cyfyngwyd ar ein cwmpas i wella'r agwedd hon ar yr asesiad gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen datblygu'r wybodaeth hon o ran trafodaethau ar flaenoriaethau, yn enwedig y rheini a ddiffinnir yn ofodol. Bydd proffiliau ystadegol cychwynnol yr Ardaloedd Cymunedol yn cael eu darparu mewn Atodiad i amlygu nodweddion, gwahaniaethau ac anghydraddoldebau sylfaenol ardaloedd, gydag ystadegau a nodweddion allweddol pob ardal hefyd wedi'u nodi yn y bennod 'Proffil Abertawe'.

u (t3) D
Mae cyflwyniad mwy cyson wedi'i ddefnyddio yn fersiwn derfynol yr asesiad.
u (t3) DN / C
Nodwyd y sylw, ond bwrir ymlaen â hyn yng ngham nesaf y broses (dadansoddi ymatebion), gan gynnwys canfyddiadau'r comisiwn ymchwil.
ı (t4 & D
Bydd cyflwyno'r dadansoddiad hwn yn cael ei ddiwygio fel y bo'n briodol mewn Atodiad 1 diwygiedig. Nid aethpwyd ar drywydd dadansoddiad pellach o ddata'r arolwg, gan gynnwys fesul ardal gymunedol a grŵp oedran ar y cam hwn gan fod meintiau samplau'r arolwg yn gyfyngedig ac oherwydd cyfyngiadau o ran adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, mae dyfyniadau cyhoeddus o'r arolwg wedi'u cynnwys o fewn adrannau pwnc yr asesiad
gymune meintia oherwy bynnag

we would recommend highlighting that the finalizes		torfunal
we would recommend highlighting that the findings		terfynol.
cannot be said to be statistically representative of the		
wider population, and stating that any quantitative		
findings from the survey should be treated as		
indicative only of what the wider population might		
think, and instead focus on the qualitative intelligence		
gathered from the survey.		
We note that further coding and qualitative analysis is		
being included in the next steps, along with inclusion		
of illustrative quotations and further breakdowns by		
community area / age group etc. This approach is		
encouraging and we expect it will provide a strong		
basis for a plan that is informed by local engagement		
and intelligence gathering, coupled with the higher		
level quantitative analysis.		
The annex outlines in detail the approach taken to the		
collection and analysis of evidence and data, but it		
would be useful to include a short methodology		
section in the main assessment summarising this		
information and providing some background to the		
methods used.		
In summary, Review the way results of the primary		
research are presented and focus more on the		
qualitative rather than the quantitative findings. (WG		
category B)		
C15) Cyffredinol	Llywodraeth Cymru (t4 &	С
	t6)	
Quality of Analytical Approach – Overall, the		Bwrir ymlaen â hyn yng ngham dadansoddi
assessment provides a thorough, comprehensive and		ymatebion y broses i lywio'r cynllun lles, a gaiff ei
methodical situation analysis. This can now be		lywio i ddechrau gan yr Asesiad a'r comisiwn
		1

strengthened by starting the response analysis ("so what does this all mean for Swansea and the communities within it?") to inform the well-being plan. (WG category B)		ymchwil.
C16) Cyffredinol	Llywodraeth Cymru (t5 & t6)	C / D
Future trends – Future trends and prospects for Swansea are included as topics throughout the assessment. However, these sections could be strengthened by including more detail on projections and future trends, although we note this is part of your next steps and you will be using the latest Future Trends Report. In order to strengthen this aspect of the assessment, we would suggest considering the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix and including this in the introduction or early on in the assessment in order to clearly set out issues that need to be monitored, issues that require further research and issues that are critical and need to be prioritised. In summary, <i>Build on the future trends work by</i> <i>including more projections and consider using the PSB</i> <i>Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix.</i> (WG category B)		Mae gwybodaeth o'r adroddiad Tueddiadau'r Dyfodol wedi llywio agweddau ar yr asesiad hwn, er nid mewn modd mor gynhwysfawr ag y byddem wedi hoffi oherwydd adnoddau. Rydym yn cydnabod bod hyn yn fater ac rydym yn ymrwymedig i ystyried tueddiadau'r dyfodol yn llawnach yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles. Mae'n bosib yr ystyrir y defnydd o Fatrics Effaith/Sicrwydd yn y Dyfodol y BGC ymhellach fel rhan o'r cam dadansoddi ymatebion, er mwyn llywio'r broses o bennu amcanion ar gyfer y cynllun lles.
C17) Penodau cyffredinol / lluosog	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	 D. Byddwn yn ystyried cynnwys yr wybodaeth hon mewn atodiad 'Cefndir' newydd i'r prif
 The following improvements are suggested: i. An explanation of how topics are chosen for inclusion in the different chapters. It would help to be more explicit about how the Assessment was produced. 	-,	asesiad, ynghyd â rhagor o fanylion am wahanol agweddau ar y broses gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, mae cyflwyniadau'r bennod bresennol hefyd yn ystyried hyn. ii. DN. Mae'r is-bennawd pwnc 'Meysydd i'w

ii. Less focus	on individual projects that are already		gwella' hefyd yn ceisio adlewyrchu diffygion.
	and more focus on the areas where		Bydd ystyried tensiynau/cyfaddawdau yn agwedd
	le work going on / unmet need. More		ar y comisiwn dadansoddi.
	ficits, tensions and trade-offs, beyond	iii.	
	the key challenges being faced.		wedi'u cynnwys lle y bo modd.
	the seven well-being goals of the	iv	DN. Cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach gan
	of Future Generations Act could be		gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser. Byddwn yn
-	cit and more reference made to		ystyried ychwanegu hyperddolenni at y dudalen
	d regional policies and strategies in		gynnwys a chyflwyniadau'r penodau.
	g., State of Natural Resources Report,	v	DN. Ystyriwyd y byddai hyn yn anodd ei roi ar
	Needs Assessment, Local Development		waith oherwydd yr amrywiaeth o bynciau a
Plans).			chyfranwyr.
	s between chapters (e.g. hyperlinks) to	vi.	DN. Byddai lles meddyliol wedi bod yn bwnc o
	cation and avoid overlap between topic		fewn y bennod 'Cymdeithasol' pe bai adnoddau
	n individual chapters.		ar gael. Mae cyfeiriad at yr Asesiad o Anghenion
	nsistency between chapters in detailing		Poblogaeth a baratowyd yn gydamserol wedi'i
	engagement when producing the		gynnwys yn y ddogfen derfynol.
Assessmen		vii.	DN. Mae'r dadansoddiad o Ardaloedd
	ndirect links to mental well-being		Cymunedol yn amrywiol, ond pennir hyn yn
	, it would be helpful to see more		rhannol gan argaeledd data a safbwyntiau
-	us on this in the document as it is a key		awduron pwnc.
	e well-being of the population.	viii.	DN. Cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach gan
	ng in describing the differences		gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser. Fodd bynnag,
	fferent communities within the area		mae rhai adrannau eisoes yn ystyried yr agwedd
and their n	eeds. Where there is data there is often		ranbarthol ar bynciau.
	erpretation of what it means, and	ix.	C. Cyfeiriwch at sylwadau ac ymatebion
	lanation of statistics such as confidence		blaenorol ynghylch Tueddiadau'r Dyfodol.
	nd statistical significance.	x.	D. Amlinellir hyn yn y Cyflwyniad a bydd
	erence/information on cross-boundary		gwybodaeth ychwanegol yn cael ei chynnwys yn
issues.	. , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		yr atodiad cefndir cyhyd ag y bo modd.

 ix. Strengthening the information and interpretation presented on prediction of future trends, particularly in terms of impact on future generations. x. Further information on how the assessment will be used to develop objectives and a subsequent plan. xi. Language could be less technical, possible benefit of summary sections as well as an acronym guide. xii. The use of the well-being goals and ways of working within the legislation could be made more explicit throughout the document, in particular around long-term thinking and prevention. 		 xi. DN / C. Cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser. Fodd bynnag, bwriedir cyhoeddi fersiwn hawdd ei darllen o'r asesiad, a fydd yn adnodd i lywio'r cynllun lles. xii. DN. Fe'i cyfyngwyd gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser.
C18) Cyffredinol / Pob pennod	Arolwg – Eiriolaeth eich	C
None of the members were able to understand it. The assessment should allow people with Learning disabilities to understand it and allow them to have their voices heard.	Llais	Ein nod yw datblygu fersiwn hawdd ei darllen o'r asesiad terfynol, a fydd yn cefnogi ac yn llywio proses y Cynllun Lles.
C19) Cyffredinol / Pob pennod	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
Address poor management practices in the public sector		
C20) Cyffredinol / (Yr Economi a'r Amgylchedd)	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
More green spaces during building projects through the city,		Mae darparu mannau gwyrdd yn ystyriaeth allweddol ym mhob datblygiad adfywio diweddar. Bwriedir gosod parc dros dro yn ardal Abertawe Ganolog.

C21) Cyffredinol / (Yr Economi a'r Amgylchedd)	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
council only using building company within its borders to cut co2 emissions		Byddai hyn yn gofyn am newid yn rheolau caffael y cyngor sydd y tu hwnt i gwmpas yr asesiad hwn.
C22) Cyffredinol / (Amgylchedd)	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	DN
Reference/s to natural resources and the risks, impacts and opportunities associated with them across all well- being dimensions could be more spatially specific to better reflect important differences, inequalities, and the range of challenges and responses needed A particular theme we would encourage the PSB to explore spatially is that of equality of access to and use of high quality, natural green and blue space, and equality of access to active and sustainable travel.		Nodwyd y sylw, ond mae cyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser yn cyfyngu ar unrhyw ystyriaeth bellach. Gellir ystyried y materion hyn gan y cyhoeddiad canlynol o'r Asesiad.
C23) Cyffredinol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	С
'Integration' is a Topic sub-heading within each chapter and this has helped raise awareness and focus minds on making linkages within / between chapters and topics. It is recommended that the Assessment and evolving well-being planning process looks builds on these high-level linkages to ensure that well-being is considered 'in the round', key cross-cutting themes are identified, and the ground is paved for meaningful collaboration to tackle issues such as transformation of the food, energy, and transportation systems.		Bydd y pwyntiau hyn yn cael eu hystyried mewn trafodaethau parhaus wrth ddatblygu blaenoriaethau / amcanion y cynllun lles.
C24) Cyffredinol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	DN
The positive reference to beaches and parks / green		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach

space as important natural assets for cultural and economic well-being, particularly tourism, but also as an amenity that innately enhances well-being is welcomed. However, this could be strengthened by considering the risks / challenges and future trends for these assets and knock-on effects (the 'so what?') for longer-term and sustainable cultural and economic well-being.		gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser. Bydd y materion hyn, sy'n arbennig o bwysig o ran lles diwylliannol ac economaidd, yn cael eu hystyried bellach gan y cyhoeddiad canlynol o'r Asesiad.
C25) Cyffredinol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	C/D
In some sections the draft narrative around future trends could be strengthened with reference to the Future Trends Wales report, to draw out and add details across chapters / topics, as are relevant to Swansea.		Mae gwybodaeth o adroddiad Tueddiadau'r Dyfodol wedi llywio agweddau ar yr asesiad hwn, er nid mewn modd mor gynhwysfawr ag y byddem wedi hoffi oherwydd adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn cydnabod bod hyn yn broblem ac rydym yn ymrwymedig i ystyried tueddiadau'r dyfodol yn llawnach yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles. Diwygiwyd y tudalennau Cyflwyniad yn yr asesiad terfynol i adlewyrchu hyn.
C26) Cyffredinol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	С
There is opportunity and need to enhance this assessment and its usefulness in informing further discussions through more detailed assessment of potential impacts on key assets, including infrastructure, protected areas/habitats, and communities. This could be done by identifying, as relevant across all four well-being dimensions, those risks which the <i>Climate Change Risk Assessment 3</i> <i>(CCRA3) Welsh summary report</i> lists as high magnitude		Caiff ei ystyried a bydd yn llywio trafodaethau yn y dyfodol.

and requiring action now, and what they mean for		
specific communities and aspects of well-being.		
C27) Cyffredinol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	D
Include in the document, where most relevant,		
responses regarding climate change that were		
received through well-being assessment survey,		
engagement activities, and consultation, particularly		
lived experience.		
C28) Cyffredinol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	D
Add / update narrative with reference to the latest		
findings of the IPCC 6th Assessment report:		
"The cumulative scientific evidence is unequivocal:		
Climate change is a threat to human well-being and		
planetary health. Any further delay in concerted		
anticipatory global action on adaptation and		
mitigation will miss a brief and rapidly closing window		
of opportunity to secure a liveable and sustainable		
future for all."		
IPCC Sixth Assessment Report, 2022.	Cufe ath Naturial Curary	D/C
C29) Cyffredinol / Amgylchedd	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	D/C
It is recommended to also refer to:		
The Climate and Nature charter		
• The work Swansea Council is leading, with support		
from SEF and the WWN task group, and how this work		
will help to get a fuller picture of how identified		
impacts will be addressed, and how current policies		
and strategies link to the ability to manage risks.		

 It may be that the above warrants the addition of a climate change topic although, ideally, this should be addressed across and by all dimensions of well-being. C30) Cyffredinol The well-being assessment explores inequalities 	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	C Bydd hyn yn cael ei ystyried gan y BGC ac yn llywio
between different demographic groups and communities in Swansea mainly from a social and economic perspective. Although this provides critically important insights, environmental inequalities resulting from different levels of exposure to environmental risks are only partially addressed. The links between all well-being dimensions and their causal relationships on inequalities are not fully considered and therefore remain unclear. A more integrated perspective and understanding of this topic should be developed as this would generate valuable additional insights. Recommendation: Refer to and include, where relevant, findings and recommendations from the FGC for Wales report: <i>Inequality in a Future Wales: Areas</i> <i>for action in work, climate and demographic change.</i> This may help highlight priority areas (topical, socio- economic, spatial) in Swansea for further discussion.		trafodaethau yn y dyfodol.
CIA) Cofficiential	Angluing Tîng la shuid	DN
Cl1) Cyflwyniad	Arolwg – Tîm lechyd Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	DN
It is noted the community areas are defined by		Diffinnir yr Ardaloedd Cymunedol yn seiliedig ar
primary care cluster, which is an important area to		glystyrau gofal sylfaenol, fel yn 2017. Fodd bynnag,
consider, given primary care provision is a key issue		nid oedd adnoddau ar gael i ystyried darpariaeth

that has a significant impact on health and wellbeing of the population of Swansea. We would have liked to see more information on this aspect addressed in the Assessment. It is also worth considering other geographical areas that are important for well-being planning, in particular the community areas defined within Local Development Plans.		gofal sylfaenol (e.e. fel rhan o bwnc iechyd cyffredinol) yn yr asesiad hwn. Ystyrir ardaloedd daearyddol eraill ar sail argaeledd data ar gyfer y pwnc penodol.
Cl2) Cyflwyniad	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	D
It was helpful to see the detail around methods of engagement in Appendix 1, although further detail on the sub-group involved would be useful. Recognising limitations during pandemic, it will be important to consider how we can improve engagement in the future, using the assets of partners in achieving this. More detail on the regional Co- ordination Board would be useful and how engagement has featured as part of this structure.		Bydd yr wybodaeth hon yn cael ei hystyried i'w chynnwys mewn atodiad 'Cefndir' newydd i'r prif asesiad.
Cl3) Cyflwyniad	Arolwg – Cangen Aelodau sydd wedi ymddeol UNITE	D
The introduction is fine but the Chairs Welcome statement really makes clear the current dire context	yn Ardal Abertawe a Chonfensiwn Pensiynwyr	Mae neges ragarweiniol gan y Bwrdd bellach yn cyfeirio at effaith 'digwyddiadau geo-wleidyddol y
now added to by the crisis in Ukraine	Cenedlaethol Cymru	byd'.
Cl4) Cyflwyniad	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
More police involvement		
PD1) Proffil demograffig	Llywodraeth Cymru (t3)	D
The map and table included on page 10 of the		Wedi'i gywiro ar gyfer y fersiwn derfynol.

assessment has inconsistent colours, which makes it		
confusing to read e.g. Bay East is orange on the map,		
and green in the table. Additionally, it would be		
helpful if the map could be enlarged to make it easier		
to read the text and details on the map.		
PD2) Proffil demograffig	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd	DN
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
This was a useful summary, although it is not always		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach
clear how this links to the other chapters and how it		oherwydd cyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser. Fodd
will go on to inform the well-being plans. More detail		bynnag, bydd proffiliau ystadegol o'r Ardaloedd
in relation to the different communities which make		Cymunedol yn cael eu darparu mewn Atodiad i
up Swansea (defined by the primary care clusters in		dynnu sylw at nodweddion a gwahaniaethau
this document) would be useful.		sylfaenol ardaloedd.
PD3) Proffil demograffig	Arolwg – Cangen Aelodau	D
	sydd wedi ymddeol UNITE	
The fact that there will be an increase in the number	yn Ardal Abertawe a	Mân addasiadau wedi'u gwneud i'r adran sy'n
of people aged 65 and older should not be seen as "a	Chonfensiwn Pensiynwyr	ystyried poblogaeth fesul oedran.
burden" and should be challenged as ageism. Older	Cenedlaethol Cymru	
people make a significant contribution in Swansea in		
so many ways - including being Income tax & Council		
Tax payers!		
PD4) Proffil demograffig	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	p10 D. Gwelliant wedi'i nodi a'i wneud
		p11 D. Map dwysedd poblogaeth wedi'i ddiweddaru
p10 need same colours on the map and table		i amcangyfrifon 2020 (y diweddaraf sydd ar gael)
(community areas);		p11 D. Fformatau teitlau'r tabl wedi'u safoni
p11 why using 2011 ONS statistics for Swansea?;		p12 DN
p11 composition of Swansea population table by sex		p13 DN. Nid yw pob carfan oedran wedi'i hystyried
and age;		oherwydd lle, gyda thueddiadau llai sylweddol i sylwi
p12 population pyramid refers to Swansea by age and		arnynt mewn rhai achosion.
gender;		p14 DN. 16-64 oed yw'r diffiniad safonol o 'oedran

p13 specific cohorts – no mention of 16-19, 60-64, 75- 84; p14 why is working age 16-64 – women work until 67		gweithio' o hyd mewn ystadegau swyddogol.
PD5) Proffil demograffig	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
Too much money spent on town Centre projects		
PD6) Proffil demograffig	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	D
To set the scene and give important context from the start of this key assessment, and as Swansea's outstanding natural environment is a major part of the county's identity and a big draw to visitors, a 'Place Profile' giving a more detailed overview of landscape and natural assets could be added following the 'Demographic Profile' chapter.		Fe'i cynhwysir yn fersiwn derfynol yr Asesiad fel rhan o 'Broffil Abertawe'.
LC1) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd	D
	Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	
The subheading 'adult social care' is the same as the	Cymru (t7)	Mae'r cyflwyniad i'r pwnc 'Gofal Cymdeithasol'
topic heading 'social care'. This could be made clearer.		bellach yn nodi'r is-bynciau sydd oddi mewn. Diwygiwyd y fformatio.
LC2) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Llywodraeth Cymru (t5)	DN / C
the 'Perceptions and perspectives' section under Children, Young People and Families on p26 mentions evidence collected from members of Swansea Council's Corporate Parenting Board and Care Experienced Children and Young People since December 2020. It would be useful to provide some additional information on this exercise to emphasise		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach oherwydd cyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser ar y cam hwn. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn cydnabod bod hyn yn broblem a byddwn yn ei hystyried ymhellach yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles.

the valuable engagement work that has been		
undertaken as part of the assessment, and also		
provide some background information for data		
sources such as the National Survey.		
LC3) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Llywodraeth Cymru (t5-6)	DN
The assessment is silent on Welsh medium childcare		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach
although there is a reference to Welsh medium		oherwydd cyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser ar y cam
education. It would benefit from further detail of plans		hwn. Credwn fod Asesiadau Gofal Plant a
to increase the provision of Welsh medium childcare in		Digonolrwydd Chwarae'r cyngor yn ystyried hyn yn
the local authority so that there is a clear transition for		fanwl.
some children into Welsh medium education.		
LC4) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd	D
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
There are a broad range of topics covered in this		Pennwyd cynnwys y bennod gan yr wybodaeth a
chapter. However, it would be useful to include		dderbyniwyd oddi wrth bartneriaid. Byddwn yn
information on how decisions were reached on which		ystyried cynnwys gwybodaeth bellach am y detholiad
topics were included, and which were not.		o bynciau yn yr Atodiad 'Cefndir'.
LC5) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd	DN
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
There is some overlap between topics within this		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach
chapter, for example multiple topic areas cover early		oherwydd cyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser ar y cam
years and children and young people. It would be		hwn.
beneficial if there was consolidation of these topic		
areas or clear links between the different topic areas.		
LC6) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd	D
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
It would also be useful if links could be made between		Mae adran ar 'Integreiddio' o fewn pob pwnc sydd
topics which may have impact in different chapters of		â'r bwriad o ddod â'r cysylltiadau hyn allan, a nod y
the assessment, for example how wildfires impact		comisiwn ymchwil yw datblygu hyn ymhellach.

environmental well-being.		Ychwanegwyd cyfeiriad penodol yn y pwnc tanau gwyllt at les amgylcheddol.
LC7) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Tîm lechyd	DN
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
There are some gaps within the populations included		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach
in the chapter. For example, there is a focus on		oherwydd cyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser ar y cam
children and young people and older adults, but less		hwn.
focus on the general adult, working-age population.		
Including information on this population would be		
beneficial to understanding wider population well-		
being.		
LC8) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	D
On page 28, you have listed services delivered by		Nodir y Ganolfan yn yr asesiad ac mae gwybodaeth
YMCA for Young Carers, but no list of services provided		ychwanegol gyffredinol am ei rôl wedi'i chynnwys.
by Swansea Carers Centre, in this section - they		
provide crucial services for carers - please can you add		
them in		
LC9) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Tîm lechyd	DN
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
Would have liked to have seen more information on		Mae'r materion hyn yn agweddau pwysig ar iechyd
the following addressed in the Assessment:		corfforol, sy'n cael ei gydnabod fel bwlch o fewn y
Tobacco control		bennod 'Cymdeithasol'. Ystyrir y pynciau hyn yn yr
 Chronic disease management 		Asesiad o Anghenion Poblogaeth, y cyfeirir ato yn y
Immunisation.		bennod hon.
These are all key issues that can significantly impact		
the health and wellbeing of the population of Swansea		
but were either absent from the Assessment or had		
very limited reference.		
LC10) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Tîm lechyd	DN

	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
Would have liked to have seen more detail and links made to:		Mae'r materion hyn yn agweddau pwysig ar iechyd corfforol, sy'n cael ei gydnabod fel bwlch o fewn y
• The importance of addressing health and wellbeing		bennod 'Cymdeithasol'. Fodd bynnag, nodir
in the early years		cyfraniad mannau gwyrdd at les yn y pwnc Rheoli
 The Healthy Weight Healthy Wales Strategy 		Isadeiledd Gwyrdd a Chreu Lleoedd (Yr Amgylchedd),
• The importance of green spaces (for example, how		a nodweddion camddefnyddio sylweddau yn y
this links to mental health and positive wellbeing in		bennod 'Cymdeithasol'. Byddai rhai o'r pynciau hyn
Swansea)		hefyd yn cael sylw mewn Asesiad o Anghenion
 Substance misuse (including alcohol use). These 		Poblogaeth ar wahân.
topics were covered in the assessment but could		
benefit from further detail.		
LC11) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Cangen Aelodau	С
	sydd wedi ymddeol UNITE	
There is strong evidence that older people are	yn Ardal Abertawe a	Nodwydd y sylwadau, a chânt eu hystyried
becoming more Socially isolated and are very nervous	Chonfensiwn Pensiynwyr	ymhellach yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles.
about resuming contact etc. Recent events may well	Cenedlaethol Cymru	
accelerate the need to develop proper, green energy		
powered public transport which will be challenging for		
a Urban rural City like Swansea but it also offers		
opportunities for employment and the local		
development of appropriate technologies. We would		
strongly support the steering group taking on the role		
of Ageing Well Champions provided that is done in a		
truly inclusive and open manner. We support the		
comments on the risks of digital exclusion.		
LC12) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – Cangen Aelodau	DN
	sydd wedi ymddeol UNITE	
Support the Chapters on Housing, Poverty & Crime	yn Ardal Abertawe a	
and Safety	Chonfensiwn Pensiynwyr	

	Cenedlaethol Cymru	
LC13) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
Life expectancy is 77 years for Swansea males , but		
council retirement age is now 66 , do you think it's fair		
to spend only 11 years in retirement		
LC14) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	D / DN / C
p17 stage of the pandemic;		Adolygwyd y bennod asesu yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau
p22 suggest a model of assisted living around green		hyn ac fe'i diweddarwyd lle y bu modd a lle'r oedd
spaces/growing spaces;		hynny'n briodol.
p30 carers must be paid a salary that enable them to		
live a good life;		Ystyrir bod rhai o'r sylwadau'n ymwneud yn fwy â
p34 bottom chart needs an explanation. It is not clear		pholisi ac yn briodol i'w hystyried yn ystod proses y
what it means;		Cynllun Lles.
p42 it has exacerbated;		
p43 how was 50* consultation carried out in August		
and September 2021? I didn't see it;		
p45 Ageing well section is repetitive in several places;		
p48 weekly earnings last column, Swansea (workplace)		
not clear what that means;		
p62 line justification is not working at bottom of page;		
p63 people sleeping rough table - confusing actual vs.		
estimated - I don't understand why need estimated;		
p70 need greater percentage of affordable housing;		
p87 as an improvement, could Swansea become the		
social eating capital of Wales? My vision for the city		
centre - all restaurants and cafes selling healthy local,		
seasonal, high quality, nutrient dense food; need		
council and business support for Bwyd Abertawe and		

Swansea becoming a Sustainable Food Places network member; I wanted to know more about diets, food, diet-related no communicable diseases and plans for changing food environments to make healthy food the easy choice, and facilitating behaviour change on healthy regenerative local, seasonal and nutrient dense food choices; need people care permaculture ethic prioritised		
LC15) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	DN / C
It is particularly heartening to see that young people (in response to a consultation exercise) have as their number one priority, 'Protecting the Environment and Green Spaces' (ref Social Chapter, Listening to Children and Young People: Perceptions and Perspectives); it will be paramount to ensure these conversations are continued with support for YP to be involved in decision-making about their future in Swansea particularly around this theme. Perhaps the PSB's Human Rights City Steering Group may be in a position to take this forward?		Nodwydd y sylwadau, a chânt eu hystyried ymhellach yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles.
LC16) Llesiant cymdeithasol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	C
Due to the acknowledged gap on (mental and physical) health in the Social section, there has not been opportunity to identify and discuss the significant links between health and natural resources, particularly active travel, air and water quality, access to green and blue space, flood risk, GI, etc although there is mention of these associations within topics under the		Nodwyd y sylw, ond mae cyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser yn cyfyngu ar ddiwygiadau pellach. Ystyrir hyn ymhellach yn ystod proses y Cynllun Lles.

Environment chapter. We would welcome opportunity to work with PSB partners to input to health topics and/or provide some narrative to acknowledge these important links and commit to exploring them in the development of objective and priority setting for the Well-being Plan. Recommendation: Include narrative and refs to case studies / relevant research and policy on links between health and natural resources, and nature-based solutions for health and well-being.		
LE1) Llesiant economaidd Skills for the future – There is good information contained within the 'Swansea's workforce' section and it's positive to hear the Council and its local/regional partners are working to create a more skilled workforce in the future we encourage you to consider the findings in our recent <u>report</u> on the skills needed to transition to a low carbon economy. It finds that across Wales there are significant skills gaps in green industries which must be addressed.	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol Cymru (t5)	D Fel y nodwyd yn y bennod, y rhaglen Sgiliau a Thalent o dan y Fargen Ddinesig yw'r un arweiniol ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â bylchau mewn sgiliau. Mae'r testun wedi'i ddiweddaru. Nodir hefyd y strategaeth Isadeiledd Gwyrdd (IG) a chyfeirir at hyfforddiant ar gyfer IG.
This could be explored further within the 'Future trends and prospects for Swansea' area of the 'Swansea workforce' section and in relation to the discussion of school attainment and training and education provision in the region. Clear links should also be made to your local Regional Skills Partnership. LE2) Llesiant economaidd	Arolwg – Tîm lechyd	DN

	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
The link between income and wellbeing is well		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ystyriaeth bellach
established. The chapter contains a lot of useful data.		oherwydd cyfyngiadau adnoddau/amser ar y cam
However, it doesn't often specify the differences		hwn.
between population subgroups within Swansea. In		
particular, the differences between areas and		
communities, now and in the future. Where data isn't		
available, this could be speculated on. The section on		
educational attainment is a good example of where		
differences between population subgroups are well		
covered. It would be useful to see more interpretation		
of what the data is telling us about the well-being		
needs of the population.		
LE3) Llesiant economaidd	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd	DN
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
There is a lot of focus on current strengths and assets		Mae'r prosiectau sy'n mynd rhagddynt yn mynd i'r
(e.g. projects already underway). It would be helpful to		afael â diffygion hysbys drwy greu mwy o ddwysedd
know more about where the deficits are and any		yng nghanol y ddinas (pobl sy'n byw ac yn gweithio),
tensions and challenges to improving wellbeing in		er mwyn denu ymwelwyr i gefnogi busnesau a lles
these areas.		economaidd.
		Mae meysydd gwella gan gynnwys diffygion eisoes
		wedi'u nodi mewn adrannau pwnc, e.e.
LE4) Llesiant economaidd	Arolwa - Cangon Aolodau	cynhyrchiant. DN
	Arolwg – Cangen Aelodau sydd wedi ymddeol UNITE	אוט
Climate change and rising sea levels represent the	yn Ardal Abertawe a	Mae ynni adnewyddadwy yn genhadaeth allweddol
biggest challenges and again external events are	Chonfensiwn Pensiynwyr	yn y cynllun Cyflawni Economaidd Rhanbarthol.
driving the need to develop green and self sufficient	Cenedlaethol Cymru	
energy, not to rely on world markets		Cyfeirir eisoes at y strategaeth ynni rhanbarthol yn y
energy, not to rely on world markets		Cyrenn eisoes al y su'alegaeth ynni fhandarthof yn y

		cyflwyniad i'r bennod ar yr Economi.
LE5) Llesiant economaidd	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	D / DN
p104 why do we need smart agriculture - this is industrial agriculture, the wrong paradigm!; p113 GVA section is repetitive to earlier section in Swansea economic infrastructure; p120 why working age is 16-64 when women retire at 67?; let's have the pilot for UBI in Swansea; p128 if Swansea is a Sustainable Food Place, that would improve the local food economy; need doughnut economics for Swansea and refer to bioregions; need permaculture fair share ethic prioritised		Adolygwyd y bennod asesu yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau hyn ac fe'i diweddarwyd lle y bu modd a lle'r oedd hynny'n briodol.
LE6) Llesiant economaidd	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
Spend money on developing the tidal lagoon		Mae ynni llanw'n cael ei ddatblygu gan brosiect Eden Las sy'n cael ei arwain gan y sector preifat a chyfeirir ato yn y bennod Lles Economaidd.
LE7) Llesiant economaidd	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	DN
Recommended additional narrative around the Circular Economy, Covid-19, and Swansea Bay City Deal projects that contribute to the low carbon / net zero ambitions of the region.		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ddiwygiadau pellach gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser.
LA1) Llesiant amgylcheddol Net Zero: The environment chapter refers to Welsh Government's Low Carbon Delivery Plan (Prosperity	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol Cymru (t8)	D

for All, 2019). Please note, this document has been		
updated and replaced with 'Net Zero'.		
LA2) Llesiant amgylcheddol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd	D
	Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	
Reference not included properly on page 151.	Cymru (t8)	
LA3) Llesiant amgylcheddol	Arolwg – Tîm lechyd	DN
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
There is a mixture of quantitative and qualitative data		Crybwyllir iechyd yn gyson drwy gydol pennod Yr
summarising environmental well-being and good		Amgylchedd.
references to environmental well-being integrated into		
the cultural chapter as well. There is also reference to		Y bwriad yw y bydd integreiddio rhwng dimensiynau
the intrinsic connection between people, our health		a phynciau, gan gynnwys yr amgylchedd ac iechyd,
and well-being which is welcomed. There are useful		yn cael ei amlygu ymhellach ac yr helaethir arno o
and informative references to school settings, as well		fewn y dadansoddiad ymatebion a gaiff ei lywio gan
as useful reference to active travel and green		y comisiwn ymchwil academaidd.
infrastructure, food and climate change, food poverty,		
and food production, all of which will have clear		
impacts on the health and well-being of the population		
of Swansea. However, these topics are not necessarily		
linked to health throughout the assessment which		
would provide further context and richer detail on the		
well-being of the local population.		
LA4) Llesiant amgylcheddol	Arolwg – Tîm lechyd	D
	Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	
There is limited reference to physical health as well as		Diwygiadau wedi'u gwneud i gynnwys effeithiau
mental health and well-being, and limited detail on the		newid yn yr hinsawdd ar fwyd ac iechyd.
range of direct and indirect health impacts from		
climate change. There are some policies / areas which		Fel y cydnabuwyd yn y cyflwyniad i'r Asesiad, mae
aren't clearly referenced and further detail on these		bylchau yn y bennod 'Cymdeithasol' sy'n rhoi cyfle
areas would be welcomed, including Net Zero and		cyfyngedig i drafod yn fanylach effeithiau newid

 local development planning policy LA5) Llesiant amgylcheddol See comments on economic well-being! But very supportive of the Chapter. How will Swansea Resist external purchasing of land for corporate green wash tree planting? We would question the statement "Bus network coverage across Swansea is generally good". We strongly support the comment "Transport should be regarded as a universal basic service - like healthcare and education. Free or low cost public transport is central to the vision of a healthier, more equal, more prosperous Wales and achieving our climate emergency commitments." 	Arolwg – Cangen Aelodau sydd wedi ymddeol UNITE yn Ardal Abertawe a Chonfensiwn Pensiynwyr Cenedlaethol Cymru	 hinsawdd ar iechyd corfforol a meddyliol. Fodd bynnag, cyfeirir at effeithiau ehangach newid yn yr hinsawdd (e.e. perygl llifogydd, bwyd) ar iechyd ym mhennod Yr Amgylchedd, a chaiff y materion hyn eu trafod wrth ddatblygu blaenoriaethau'r Cynllun Lles. DN DN. Yn ystod datblygiad yr asesiad ni chodwyd unrhyw bryderon penodol ynghylch y mater hwn am dir yn Abertawe. Credwn fod y mater o brynu tir (allanol) yn rhywbeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ceisio mynd i'r afael ag ef. DN. Mae'r datganiad yn oddrychol, a derbynnir y gall fod safbwyntiau gwahanol ar y mater hwn. DN
LA6) Llesiant amgylcheddol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	D / DN
p131 and p132 highlighting food is important - need to emphasise how it is grown and processed, ideally to optimise healthy biomes; p133 Table x (needs a number) for a summary of resilience; p134 GI section (pxx);		Adolygwyd y bennod asesu yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau hyn ac fe'i diweddarwyd lle y bu modd a lle'r oedd hynny'n briodol. Rydym yn croesawu ymateb meddylgar a thrylwyr i'r asesiad drafft. Nodir sylwadau ar bwyntiau penodol isod:
p135 need to link to green prescribing, article by		p131/132 – DN. Yn y paragraffau hyn mae'r

Michele Howarth et al (2020), also connections to soil	cyfeiriadau at fwyd a systemau eraill yn bwysig.
health, regenerative agriculture to food quality and	p133 – D
human health. Why not declare a health emergency?	p134 – D
diet-related noncommunicable disease prevalances	, p135 – D. Mae'r cyfeiriad rhagnodi gwyrdd bellach
are worsening!;	wedi'i gynnwys
p136 myco-remediation of contaminated soils;	p136 – DN
p137 why is Table x inserted several pages after when	p137 – D. Tabl wedi symud / esboniad o ffensys heb
it was first mentioned? need a permaculture approach	ffens
to design. What is fenceless fencing? stop using	p139 – D. Nodwyd yn Adnoddau Dŵr a Phriddoedd/
glyphosate, what is a Sustainable Farming scheme?;	Bwyd
p136 refer to the hydrological cycle of Walter Jehne -	p140 – D. Mae rhagor o wybodaeth am ddŵr
the soil carbon sponge. Stop using toxic chemicals and	ymdrochi a gwelliannau diweddar ar gael ym mhroffil
synthetic fertilisers, use mob grazing, regenerative	Dŵr Ymdrochi 2022 CNC ar gyfer Bae Abertawe.
agriculture, agroecology (urban, peri-urban, fringe and	p141 – D. Rhai gwelliannau wedi'i gwneud. Mae
rural), link between soil health and food quality based	maetholion yn cael eu hychwanegu oherwydd caiff
on nutrient density;	gwrtaith (ffosfforws a maetholion eraill) ei olchi i
p139 need regenerative agriculture to increase water	gyrff ddŵr ffo o ganlyniad i arferion rheoli tir o fewn
holding capacity of soil to replenish the aquafers.	y dalgylch (yn enwedig tir sy'n cael ei ffermio), yn
Nutrient dense food can improve soil structure and	ogystal ag o ollyngiadau eraill.
water holding capacity;	p142 – D
p140 where are sections b and d below. Table X. why	p143 – D
is faecal material running into Swansea Bay - this is	p144 – DN (wedi'i gwmpasu yn y pwnc Defnydd tir,
atrocious?;	priddoedd a bwyd)
p141 why nutrification? need to change to	p149 – D
Regenerative agriculture and agroecology as no toxic	p150/151 – D. Cyfeiriadau wedi'u hychwanegu
chemicals are used. just need to increase soil organic	p152 – DN (wedi'i gymryd o Adroddiad ar Sefyllfa
matter, improve soil structure and water holding	Adnoddau Naturiol 2022)
capacity;	p153 – D. Cyfeiriad wedi'i ychwanegu, a thestun
p142 why soil loss? transition to Regenerative	diwygiedig o ran bwyd sy'n llawn maeth, llai o
Agricuture. Table X above. do mycoremediation for	golli/wastraffu bwyd

polluted land. Why sewerage is being discharged into	p155 – D. Testun wedi'i ddiwygio (o ran SFP)
Swansea Bay - this is atrocious?; *Note should be at	p156/157 – D
the bottom of the page. Clear stream year Ref TBC.	p158 – D. Cyfeiriad wedi'i ychwanegu at
Why is sewerage being discharged into water and why	gymdogaeth 20 munud
is their poor water quality?	p159 – DN (crybwyllwyd dal a storio carbon eisoes)
p143 no need for soil erosion - keep soil covered with	p162 – DN
a living root;	p170 – DN
p144 need Regenerative agriculture and agroecology	P172 – DN
to improve soil quality;	p174 – DN. Cyfeirir eisoes at wefan 'Fy Ailgylchu
p149 need agroecology mentioned as an approach;	Cymru' LIC, sy'n rhoi gwybodaeth benodol fesul
p150 use regenerative agriculture not sustainable	awdurdod lleol ynghylch ble/sut y caiff gwastraff ei
farming. Non-market goods - better population health	drin
from high quality nutrient dense food;	P178/179 – DN (cyfeiriwch at y sylwadau uchod).
p150 reference needed for reduction in application of	
fertilisers;	
p151 need 1200 group reference;	
p152 biggest threat to soils is industrial agriculture.	
reference needed for reduction in agricultural land	
area. reference needed in relation to soils and plant	
growth. needs to be land management practices are	
driving climate change through damage to	
hydrological cycle;	
p153 need better quality nutrient dense food	
produced by regenerative agriculture/agroecological	
practices for healthier people. Nutrient dense food	
with a high brix has less food loss and less food waste.	
integrating agroecology - nature-friendly practices.	
silvopasture, smaller diversified mixed farms. use	
permaculture design and ecological principles and	
practices; p153 to tackle climate change emergency -	

reference needed;	
p154 smallscale agroecological growing. also need	
research on growing nutrient dense food that also	
sequesters more carbon. take an ecosystem approach;	
p155 designation of Swansea as a Sustainable Food	
Place (Bwyd Abertawe) to co-design a better food	
system that works for people and Nature. include	
nutrition security and population health. need to	
mention planetary boundaries. Right to Nutritious	
Food not just right to food. link to diet-related	
noncommunicable diseases. Also, the 4theregion	
south west Wales food system conference report	
recommendations;	
p156 wellbeing typo;	
p157 Berlin typo. regnerating our typo;	
p158 growing food spaces in planning. Biophilia. 20	
minute neighbourhood;	
p159 increase carbon sequestration. increase nutrient	
dense food for healthy people. up-to-date data on	
quantity and quality of GI; p160 m3 (3 superscript);	
p161 NO2 (2 subscript);	
p162 reduce ammonia by extensive cattle grazing.	
100% pasture fed livestock;	
p170 need more buses in the evening;	
p172 Swansea airport needs to be regenerated;	
p174 how is Swansea collected material for recycling	
and composting dealt with and where?;	
p178 eradicating avoidable food waste - grow nutrient	
dense food!;	
p179 change to regenerative agriculture/agroecology	

to grow nutrient dense food and increase carbon sequestration. tackling typo. several words missing;		
need earth care permaculture ethic prioritised		
LA7) Llesiant amgylcheddol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
Too many new homes built without solar or heat pumps		Mae nifer cynyddol o fentrau lleol dan arweiniad cyrff cyhoeddus a chymdeithasau tai sy'n ymgorffori cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy mewn datblygiadau
Make all builders comply and have 3 parking spaces per home - most new sites only allow for 2		tai, yn unol â chyfeiriad polisïau cenedlaethol a lleol.
		Ynghyd â hyn mae cyrff llywodraeth a chymdeithasau tai yn ystyried lleihau yn hytrach na chynyddu lle i geir preifat mewn ymateb i flaenoriaethu ac annog dewisiadau teithio mwy cynaliadwy yn sgîl yr argyfwng hinsawdd.
LA8) Llesiant amgylcheddol / Cyffredinol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
Provide support for Bwyd Abertawe to become a Sustainable Food Place to improve health and wellbeing and economy and livelihoods of people living in Swansea; there needs to be greater emphasis on food, changing the food environments to healthy; ensuring local, fresh, short, seasonal, regenerative, high quality, nutrient dense food supply chains; increasing access to land for regenerative agriculture/agroecology; prioritising local and nutrient dense food for dynamic food procurement; support fringe farming of high quality nutrient dense food; resist temptation to support hydroponics - it is greenwashing from BigAg!		Ystyrir bod hyn eisoes wedi'i gwmpasu i raddau helaeth yn yr asesiad. Cyfeiriwch hefyd at sylwadau uchod.

LA9) Llesiant amgylcheddol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	DN/C
If timings allow, it would be good to include any feedback from NRW and WG's Natur a Ni project that has been received from people living / working in Swansea.		Ni fydd y data crai o'r prosiect Natur a Ni ar gael tan ar ôl cyhoeddi'r Asesiad Lles, ond efallai y caiff ei ystyried mewn trafodaethau parhaus.
LD1) Llesiant diwylliannol	Swyddfa Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol	D
Text for 'insert image' remains on page 201.	Cymru (t8)	Mae'r ddelwedd bellach wedi'i chynnwys.
LD2) Llesiant diwylliannol	Arolwg – Tîm Iechyd Cyhoeddus Bae Abertawe	DN
We would recommend starting the document with this chapter or introducing it earlier in the document. The assessment is very lengthy, and this chapter could help to keep readers engaged. The data included reflects the area well and there is a good reflection on the variety of communities and their needs.		Nodwyd a chroesawyd y sylw. Fodd bynnag, nid yw trefn y penodau wedi newid.
LD3) Llesiant diwylliannol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	p185 – D. Ychwanegodd cyfeirnod cyhoeddi penodol p201 – D
p185 need reference for NZ ministry for culture and		p203 – C
heritage definition; p201 insert image DMP; p203 more gardeners involved in building activities; p209 need to mention food for health. Food as		p209 – DN. Mae materion bwyd ac iechyd i raddau'n cael eu codi ym mhennod Yr Amgylchedd a'r bennod Cymdeithasol p211 – C
Medicine;		p214 – DN. Sylwer: Denodd Croeso 15 o
p211 Develop skills for life - need food literacy;		gynhyrchwyr bwyd a diod, ac roedd pob un ohonynt
p214 Croeso Food and drink stalls, cookery		o Gymru; roedd 6 o Abertawe, y lleill o Sir Benfro,
demonstration (bilingual) - did they use local Nutrient dense food?;		Ceredigion, Casnewydd a Chastell-nedd Port Talbot. Yr amod i fynd i'r digwyddiad oedd bod angen iddynt

p217 Swansea is signed up - typo; p223 need funding for community groups. Very reliant on volunteers; p224 for community building grow vegetables and fresh food can be grown for food banks in community buildings		werthu cynnyrch Cymreig neu fod yn fasnachwr o Gymru. Roedd hyn hefyd yn berthnasol i stondinau crefft a masnach. Mae'r digwyddiad hefyd yn gweithio gyda thîm Marchnad Abertawe i annog gwylwyr i'r farchnad gyda'r man arddangosiadau coginio ac amserlen o weithgareddau o fewn y farchnad. O'r 13 pen-cogydd a oedd yn darparu arddangosiadau coginio, roedd 11 yn byw yng Nghymru ac roedd pob un yn defnyddio cynnyrch lleol o Gymru yn eu ryseitiau. Roedd llawer ohonynt wedi prynu cynhwysion yn uniongyrchol o Farchnad Abertawe. p217 – D p223 – C. I'w hystyried fel rhan o broses y Cynllun Lles p224 – C. I'w hystyried fel rhan o broses y Cynllun Lles.
LD4) Llesiant diwylliannol	Arolwg – aelod o'r cyhoedd	DN
Too central for most of our public, culture should be for the whole of our city not just the few who can afford to visit and park in the high cost car parks		Mae lles diwylliannol yn cwmpasu llawer iawn o bynciau sy'n digwydd ledled y ddinas, er enghraifft, mae'r Gwasanaeth Chwaraeon ac lechyd yn darparu gweithgareddau drwy Abertawe gyfan. Mae cynlluniau fel Cyfuno yn gweithio i'w gwneud yn ddiwylliannol hygyrch i bawb ac wedi cynnwys cludiant â chymhorthdal/am ddim.
LD5) Llesiant diwylliannol	Arolwg – Cangen Aelodau	DN
We support this chapter and welcome recent developments in Swansea	sydd wedi ymddeol UNITE yn Ardal Abertawe a Chonfensiwn Pensiynwyr	

	Cenedlaethol Cymru	
LD6) Llesiant diwylliannol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	DN
In the Cultural chapter, p.197, it is noted that "Swansea's key strength is its unique mix of city, coast and country offer within one destination. With award winning and globally recognised beaches, parks with green flag status and Britain's first Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, it is important to recognise the vital role the natural environment plays in boosting residents and visitors wellbeing." Recommendation: The above statement to acknowledge that Swansea's natural resources and resilience are at risk from overuse, the climate and nature emergencies, and these risks are likely to become more challenging to address if not done so now, impacting the sustainability of the tourism offer and benefits to local economic wellbeing.		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ddiwygiadau pellach gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser.
LD7) Llesiant diwylliannol	Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru	DN
Suggested improvements to the section relating to the impact of climate change on cultural heritage assets.		Nodwyd y sylw, ond cyfyngwyd ar ddiwygiadau pellach gan gyfyngiadau adnoddau ac amser.

Atodiad 1: Holiadur ar gyfer Ymgynghoriad Drafft a'r Crynodeb Canlyniadau

Mae'r adran hon yn cynnwys copi o holiadur yr arolwg a ddefnyddiwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad ar yr asesiad drafft.

Mae'r atodiad hwn hefyd yn cynnwys gwybodaeth nad yw wedi'i chynnwys fel arall yn Adran 2 yr adroddiad hwn sef 'Adborth ac Ymatebion'.

Asesiad o Les Lleol Drafft - Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Abertawe 2022

Mae Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Abertawe wedi paratoi Asesiad o Les Lleol Drafft.Defnyddir y sylfaen dystiolaeth hon i ddatblygu Cynllun Lles Lleol Abertawe 2023. Mae Deddf Llesiant Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol yn nodi sut mae Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Abertawe'n gweithio gyda phartneriaid a dinasyddion i wella ansawdd bywyd yn Abertawe.

Mae'r arolwg hwn yn adeiladu ar ymgysylltu a wnaed yn gynharach yn y broses a oedd â'r nod o ddeall beth mae lles yn ei olygu i bobl yn Abertawe.

Fodd bynnag, oherwydd effaith COVID-19 ar bob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, mae bylchau sylweddol yn yr Asesiad o Les Lleol drafft hwn. Yn benodol, effeithiwyd ar ddatblygiad cynnwys a dadansoddiad mewn perthynas â lles cymdeithasol.

Darllenwch yr Asesiad drafft a rhannwch eich barn. Defnyddir yr adborth hwn i baratoi fersiwn derfynol yr Asesiad i'w gyhoeddi.

Y dyddiad cau ar gyfer yr ymgynghoriad yw dydd Gwener 18 Mawrth 2022.

Q1	Ydych chi'n 8 (66.7%) Aelod o'r cyhoedd	2 (16.7%) Sefydliad trydydd sector/sefydliad partner (nodwch p'un)
	1 (8.3%) Gweithio i'r cyngor	0 (0.0%) Sefydliad sector preifat/sefydliad partner (nodwch p'un)
	0 (0.0%) Aelod etholedig 0 (0.0%) Partner y Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus	1 (8.3%) Arall (nodwch)

O ystyried cynnwys Asesiad o Les Lleol Drafft Abertawe:

Q2 A oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch cynnwys y cyflwyniad?

- Q3 A oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch cynnwys y bennod 'Abertawe: Proffil demograffig'?
- Q4 A oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch cynnwys y bennod Lles Cymdeithasol?
- Q5 A oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch cynnwys y bennod Lles Economaidd?
- Q6 A oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch cynnwys y bennod Lles Amgylcheddol?
- Q7 A oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch cynnwys y bennod Lles Diwylliannol?
- Q8 A oes unrhyw wybodaeth ychwanegol am les yn Abertawe y byddai'n ddefnyddiol ei chynnwys yn yr Asesiad drafft?

Sylwer bod pennod ychwanegol wedi'i chomisiynu, a fydd yn dwyn ynghyd y materion allweddol a'r cysylltiadau ar draws yr Asesiad drafft.

Q9 O ystyried cyflwyniad y ddogfen ar y cyfan, i ba raddau ydych chi'n cytuno neu'n anghytuno â'r datganiadau canlynol:

	Cytuno'n gryf	Tueddu i gytuno	Ddim yn cytuno nac yn	Tueddu i anghytuno	Anghytuno 'n gryf	Ddim yn gwybod
Mae'r Asesiad drafft yn hawdd i'w ddarllen a'i ddeall	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	anghytuno 3 (37.5%)	1 (12.5%)	1 (12.5%)	0 (0.0%)
Roeddwn i'n gallu dod o hyd I wybodaeth am bwnc yn hawdd	1 (12.5%)	3 (37.5%)	1 (12.5%)	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	0 (0.0%)
Mae'r Asesiad drafft yn rhy dechnegol	1 (11.1%)	5 (55.6%)	2 (22.2%)	1 (11.1%)	0 (0.0%)	0 (0.0%)
Mae'r Asesiad drafft wedi diwallu fy anghenion	0 (0.0%)	3 (37.5%)	2 (25.0%)	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	0 (0.0%)
Mae'r Asesiad drafft wedi gwella fy nealltwriaeth o les yn Abertawe	0 (0.0%)	4 (50.0%)	1 (12.5%)	1 (12.5%)	2 (25.0%)	0 (0.0%)

- Q10 Esboniwch pa welliannau y gellir eu gwneud
 - An Easy Read version
 - it's so long for people to read and understand
 - The following improvements are suggested: •An explanation of how topics are chosen for inclusion in the different chapters. It would help to be more explicit about how the Assessment was produced. •Less focus on individual projects that are already underway and more focus on the areas where there is little work going on / unmet need. More focus on deficits, tensions and trade-offs, beyond recognising the key challenges being faced. •The links to the seven well-being goals of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act could be made explicit and more reference made to national and regional policies and strategies in general (e.g., State of Natural Resources Report, Population Needs Assessment, Local Development Plans). •Create links between chapters (e.g. hyperlinks) to avoid duplication and avoid overlap between topic areas within individual chapters. •Greater consistency between chapters in detailing the level of engagement when producing the Assessment. •There are indirect links to mental well-being throughout, it would be helpful to see more explicit focus on this in the document as it is a key issue for the well-being of the population. •Often lacking in describing the differences between different communities within the area and their needs. Where there is data there is often limited interpretation of what it means, and limited explanation of statistics such as confidence intervals and statistical significance. •Further reference/information on cross-boundary issues. • Strengthening the information and interpretation presented on prediction of future trends, particularly in terms of impact on future generations. •Further information on how the assessment will be used to develop objectives and a subsequent plan. •Language could be less technical, possible benefit of summary sections as well as an acronym guide. •The use of the well-being goals and ways of working within the legislation could be made more explicit throughout the document, in particular around long-term thinking and prevention.
 - The overall document was very good, it was clear and very easy to read although I did find some of the chapters too long but this was probably necessary to cover all aspects.
 - Too long a read
 - Use better management practices.

Bydd Bwrdd Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Abertawe yn defnyddio'r Asesiad i ddatblygu ein Cynllun Lles Lleol 2023-2028 nesaf.

- Q11 Yn seiliedig ar y dystiolaeth yn yr Asesiad drafft, pa themâu allweddol y dylem ganolbwyntio arnynt yn eich barn chi er mwyn gwella lles yn Abertawe?
 - Being inclusive and allowing full accessibility of all things.
 - Climate Change, Public Transport, Convincing the Public that we can make a difference
 - Crime and disorder is killing community with people afraid to leave there homes in parts of our city, drugs are rife in areas such as Clase, Penlan, Sketty Park, Morriston. Do more or let these areas get worse.
 - Ones involving better management practices in the sector public
 - Social Carer supporting carers better, support, respite, assessments
 - Social Wellbeing is probably the most important and impinges on other themes. The amount of pages given to the various criteria within this theme backs this up.
 - This document covers many important issues and there are many individual issues will impact, either
 positively or negatively, on others so it is hard to estimate where the most benefit lies. Overall, it is important
 to focus on the wider determinants of well-being and factors which lie beyond the control of individuals and
 promote equity in health and wellbeing. Other important things to consider: Taking a holistic view of the
 range of issues affecting communities in Swansea when deciding on next steps. Considering the wide
 range of data that has been gathered to create this Assessment alongside responses from engagement with
 stakeholders, partners and the community, when deciding on the key themes and next steps. Considering
 which topics will have a long-term impact and lasting benefits for the population.

Atodiad 2 – Ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru

17th March 2022

Welsh Government response to the consultation on the draft assessment of local well-being for Swansea, required by the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act.

Thank you for sight of Swansea PSB's Assessment of Local Well-being.

Welsh Government acknowledges that the preparation of an assessment and the supporting evidence is a significant undertaking and recognises the amount of work that has been accomplished. Covid-19 has brought huge challenges to the public sector and PSB partners have demonstrated real dedication and resolve in overcoming some truly testing situations over this period. PSBs are demonstrating that they too have a crucial role to play in the recovery from the pandemic, in considering the social, economic, environmental and cultural impacts on communities and co-ordinating the longer-term response. Given all of this, we also recognise that the assessments have been prepared during extraordinary circumstances and this has been taken into consideration when reviewing them.

Our focus has been on the main areas we consider will go towards providing you with a comprehensive view of the state of well-being in your area, ultimately equipping you with a good, clear understanding of the sort of priorities you as a PSB can target your collective efforts to best effect on in your well-being plan. These are the second round of assessments and it is hoped that there will be lessons learned from the first iteration, building on what happened previously.

We have structured our response to the consultation on your assessment in the same way as in 2017 which is as follows:

- General comments providing an overview of thoughts on the assessment;
- More *specific comments* on the way in which the analysis has been undertaken and presented and the way in which the statutory requirements have been met;
- A *final summary table* which identifies the areas we would suggest could benefit from further development. We are adopting a consistent approach to these matters which have been categorised as follows:
 - Category A these are significant issues which we would hope would be addressed prior to publication of the well-being assessment. They might relate, for example, to compliance with the statutory requirements or a fundamental issue with the quality of the analysis
 - Category B these are matters which are important and would support a better informed well-being plan and we would hope could be addressed alongside the development of the plan
 - **Category C** these are matters which would strengthen the assessment but could be addressed over time.

We will be using the same approach in responding to each of the assessments.

Overall Thoughts

This assessment demonstrates clearly the commitment that Swansea PSB has made to embrace the challenge of assessing well-being in the area. It engages well with the key areas identified in the statutory and non-statutory guidance and demonstrates good use of a range of evidence to support the analysis. The assessment is very comprehensive and we recognise the amount of time and effort that has gone into this. The work that has been done provides a strong foundation to build on.

Our evaluation identifies some areas for further development which, if addressed could strengthen the assessment. These include more of an attempt to interpret what the data means for well-being and public services in Swansea and its communities (i.e. the response analysis), and also demonstrating a greater emphasis on the communities that have been identified and the differences that exist between them.

Comments on particular aspects of the Assessment

Statutory Requirements

The Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act (WFG Act) specifies a number of areas that the assessment must cover. This assessment appears to cover some, but not all, of the statutory requirements contained in the WFG Act.

The assessment is based around the same six community areas that were used in the 2017 well-being assessment. The introduction briefly sets out the community areas and they are occasionally referenced in parts of the assessment; however, we would like to see a lot more analysis broken down by these areas throughout the analysis and any differences or similarities between the community areas highlighted. By assessing the well-being of each community, it gives a better understanding of the diversity of the PSB area, and how the varying characteristics of each community impact on well-being, which in turn, helps determine the priorities. It would also be useful to include more background information on the community areas in the introduction, for example an overview of their key characteristics and features, in order to give the reader a better sense of the area and its geography.

The National Indicators have been referenced throughout the assessment, along with the statutory assessments and reviews which the WFG Act specifies the board must consider when preparing the well-being assessment.

Structure and Format

The assessment follows a very clear structure. We particularly like the way topics are set out under the headings 'strengths and assets', 'changes over time', 'comparisons with other places', 'differences within Swansea', 'perceptions and perspectives', 'future trends and prospects' and 'conclusions and key messages'. Overall, this makes the assessment easy to read and the 'return to contents' function included in the footnote allows easy navigation through the document – something we haven't seen in other assessments.

The introduction provides a good overview of the assessment and how you have approached the various aspects of it. The demographic profile gives the reader a useful insight into the area which is particularly helpful for those who may not be familiar with it.

There is a good use of a range of tables and figures that are clearly explained and signposted throughout the assessment. However, it is important to ensure that they are consistently presented and include a title, an x and y label, and the data source.

One small, but important, observation we noted was that the map and table included on page 10 of the assessment has inconsistent colours, which makes it confusing to read e.g. Bay East is orange on the map, and green in the table. Additionally, it would be helpful if the map could be enlarged to make it easier to read the text and details on the map.

The use of case-studies throughout the assessment is effective to support analyses and highlight key areas of interest.

Finally, you may wish to consider including an overview of what the key issues are for Swansea. This will help the board members as they reflect on what priorities to focus on in the well-being plan.

Engagement

It is clear that the PSB has set out to achieve meaningful engagement and involvement (as detailed in the accompanying annex), which aims to ensure that gaps are identified, seldomheard voices considered and the perspective of citizens included. It is encouraging that all partners have been involved in the engagement exercise and that there has been collaboration with Neath Port Talbot PSB and West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board. Your upfront acknowledgement of the difficulties with engagement faced as a result of Covid-19 also makes for a more credible assessment.

Balance and Comprehensiveness

The assessment is well-balanced and has been structured into chapters covering the four pillars of well-being. It is noticeable however that social well-being contains the most analysis – despite also acknowledging the evidence gaps in relation to health and social well-being due to the Covid-19 pandemic.

It is good to see that culture has received a fair amount of focus, following the last round of assessments, where overall it was found that culture wasn't given as much attention as the other three themes.

An analysis of Swansea as a whole is covered, with good comparison with the rest of Wales.

Overall, the assessment is very comprehensive and covers a wide range of areas, which provides a really good starting point for understanding what the issues are.

Reflective and Critical Approach

One of the positive aspects of the assessment is that overall it adopts an honest and reflective approach throughout. Each topic clearly sets out notes on the evidence source, their strengths and limitations, any inconsistencies or contradictions between them, and gaps / further research required. This provides an impressive systematic approach to the chapters and provides real credibility to the assessment.

Quality of Analytical Approach

The assessment draws on a broad range of evidence and data to provide a thorough and comprehensive situation analysis.

In total there were 330 responses to the primary research exercise. Although this is not a huge amount in terms of a quantitative survey, it potentially provides a rich basis for qualitative analysis. Some of the analysis that has been conducted so far is presented quantitatively and with levels of precision (e.g. 40.2% agreed ...) which would imply the survey is representative while this is not necessarily the case. To strengthen the credibility, we would recommend highlighting that the findings cannot be said to be statistically representative of the wider population, and stating that any quantitative findings from the survey should be treated as indicative only of what the wider population might think, and instead focus on the qualitative intelligence gathered from the survey.

We note that further coding and qualitative analysis is being included in the next steps, along with inclusion of illustrative quotations and further breakdowns by

community area / age group etc. This approach is encouraging and we expect it will provide a strong basis for a plan that is informed by local engagement and intelligence gathering, coupled with the higher level quantitative analysis.

The annex outlines in detail the approach taken to the collection and analysis of evidence and data, but it would be useful to include a short methodology section in the main assessment summarising this information and providing some background to the methods used. For example, the assessment usefully draws on data from the National Survey for Wales in several chapters and the 'Perceptions and perspectives' section under Children, Young People and Families on p26 mentions evidence collected from members of Swansea Council's Corporate Parenting Board and Care Experienced Children and Young People since December 2020. It would be useful to provide some additional information on this exercise to emphasise the valuable engagement work that has been undertaken as part of the assessment, and also provide some background information for data sources such as the National Survey.

Overall, the assessment provides a thorough, comprehensive and methodical situation analysis. This can now be strengthened by starting the response analysis ("so what does this all mean for Swansea and the communities within it?") to inform the well-being plan.

Future Trends

Future trends and prospects for Swansea are included as topics throughout the assessment. However, these sections could be strengthened by including more detail on projections and future trends, although we note this is part of your next steps and you will be using the latest Future Trends Report.

In order to strengthen this aspect of the assessment, we would suggest considering the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix and including this in the introduction or early on in the assessment in order to clearly set out issues that need to be monitored, issues that require further research and issues that are critical and need to be prioritised.

Feedback from other policy areas

Based on the feedback we have received from policy specialists across the Welsh Government, there are some very specific areas which we highlight for your consideration. For example:

• The assessment is silent on Welsh medium childcare although there is a reference to Welsh medium education. It would benefit from further detail of

plans to increase the provision of Welsh medium childcare in the local authority so that there is a clear transition for some children into Welsh medium education.

- The assessment claims to embed poverty at the heart of its policies and this is apparent from the consideration of these issues throughout. It considers employment, living wage, data and digital poverty, child poverty, housing, fuel, race, religion and age as part of the poverty agenda.
- It feels like Swansea have considered the broad range of well-being across the area. Certainly when it comes to the 'early years', they have included strong information about how their work integrates with the broader economic, social and environmental well-being of their communities. And how it compares across the region.
- From a climate change perspective, the assessment is good. It has attempted to look at all aspects of well-being with the environment and climate as a central consideration.
- In terms of crime and policing, the assessment gives a good view of different types of offending behaviours and moreover considers the factors which drive offending behaviour under the 'street vulnerability' heading.

Areas for development

Category A
Category B
More attempt to incorporate the response analysis (see 'Quality of Analytical Approach' paragraph.
More attempt to compare and contrast the community areas (see 'Statutory Requirements' paragraph).
Build on the future trends work by including more projections and consider using the PSB Futures Impact/Certainty Matrix (see Future Trends' paragraph).
Review the way results of the primary research are presented and focus more on the qualitative rather than the quantitative findings (see 'Quality of Analytical Approach' paragraph.
Category C

Atodiad 3 - Ymateb Comisiynydd Cenedlaethau'r Dyfodol

Swansea Public Services Board: Well-being assessment

Feedback and advice from the Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales, 17th March 2022

1: Summary

- A strong, comprehensive well-being assessment.
- Demonstrates detailed exploration of well-being in Swansea and commitment to the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act.
- Draws upon a range of quantitative and qualitative sources of information and data, adding depth to key findings.
- Developed in a collaborative manner involving a team of officers from the partner organisations of Swansea PSB, in conjunction with voluntary sector bodies.
- Approach to engagement highlighted within the assessment and annex 1.
- Section 3 (below) highlights areas that if further developed would help strengthen the assessment overall. These relate to: key messages, involvement, future trends, skills for the future, equality and maximising contribution to Wales' well-being goals. Desirable areas are also included for your consideration.

2: Evidence of good practice in the well-being assessment

Process and methodology

The 'Overall approach to the 2022 Assessment' section of the introduction is helpful in providing an overview of the approach undertaken to the draft assessment. From this, you state your approach has changed since the previous assessment, and the assessment is structured around the four dimensions of well-being in the Act – a structure that works well.

It's evident the draft assessment has been compiled in a collaborative manner involving a team of officers from the partner organisations of Swansea PSB, in conjunction with voluntary sector bodies. We note working groups were established and you highlight the wider regional collaboration with Neath Port Talbot PSB and the West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board – working together on a joint and common approach to the well-being assessments and population needs assessments.

The draft assessment has drawn upon a wide range of secondary qualitative and quantitative documents, which compliments the primary research, and adds depth to key findings. This is particularly useful where insight is provided on topics where there may not be in-depth quantitative data. For example, in discussion of poverty, the assessment draws upon research undertaken by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation's research on Minimum Income Standard, alongside Fair By Design, to outline the key pressures likely to be felt by households on lower incomes, e.g., childcare, transport, and access to services. Likewise, this is considered in relation to digital exclusion, where data is drawn from the National Survey for Wales and Nesta, to conclude that vulnerable households are at risk, and demonstrates some existing work (e.g., 'Our Neighbourhood'), to increase digital access and literacy in Swansea. To compliment this further, international sources add a global perspective, where, for example, lessons are drawn from 'Measuring Up: Comparing Public Transport in the UK and Europe's Biggest Cities' by The Centre for Cities.

It is helpful the introductory letter and the 'About the evidence' sections within each chapter point out the evidence yet to be collected and/or fully considered, which includes the Future Trends

report. We will be particularly interested to see the findings of the academic research commissioned which aims to bring out the key implications and messages (the 'so what') from the draft assessment. We would be grateful to have sight of this work as and when it is available.

It's good to see the approach you have taken to engagement and involvement, where you have sought to supplement the data and information presented with people's experiences. It's also good to hear that *"the level and quality of response was encouraging"* to your survey in autumn 2021. Your approach to engagement is helpfully detailed within annex 1 of the assessment.

A strength of the assessment is the clear interrogation and critical reflection of data sources, particularly quantitative data. This is evident in the way gaps are outlined, such as recognising there is 'a lack of information on where digital 'not spots' are' and noting an increase in referral numbers to support services with regard to violence against women, domestic abuse, and sexual violence may not mean an increase in incidents but in-fact increased reporting.

There is good recognition of the impact of recent events throughout the draft assessment, such as Brexit, COVID-19 and the cost of living, together with the climate and nature emergency. As you state: "*This period since the previous assessment in 2017 has in many ways been a momentous and extraordinary time*" and that these "*couldn't have been easily foreseen when the last assessment was undertaken*".

The draft assessment is honest in its recognition of the challenges and pressures of responding to the pandemic, which has meant some partners have not been able to contribute to the assessment. You highlight this is reflected most in the 'Social' chapter, particularly in relation to physical and mental health, early years and loneliness/isolation. However, we agree that the chapter does still contain extensive information, data and analysis.

The draft assessment is comprehensive and there is good evidence of connections being made throughout. For example, the 'Economy' chapter includes a focus on climate change, decarbonisation, green infrastructure, sustainable transport and energy, and highlights connections to the other chapters in the 'integration' section.

There is an honest appraisal of the data and evidence available to inform the assessment. For example, you highlight the limitations of the 2011 Census Data and state much of the analysis included may be subject to change, as the results of the 2021 Census are expected later this year.

Content

The structure of the draft assessment is clear and works well and it's particularly helpful to see a consistent format applied across each of the dimensions of well-being. This helps ensure each of the topics within the four dimensions of well-being are considered in detail, and in relation to the broader picture of well-being in Swansea.

A linked contents page upfront means the reader can navigate by topic with ease. Providing a demographic profile upfront provides useful insight to what the future of Swansea may look like. Further strengths include the introduction of each well-being chapter exploring alignment to the well-being goals, alongside an outline of key contextual factors and key sub-themes of the chapter. The inclusion of 'conclusions and key messages' at the end of each sub-topic means findings are neatly summarised. This will be particularly useful for the development of the Well-being Plan, as well as bringing issues together to help develop an overall narrative for well-being in Swansea. The inclusion of case studies and examples of projects delivered within Swansea (internal and external to the PSB) works well. These are included regularly and provide a clear picture about

challenges the PSB may be facing and how organisations and sectors are working together to address them. For example, the community cohesion projects such as Together and Tell Me More which seek to bring people from different backgrounds together.

It's reassuring the economy chapter includes a strong focus on decarbonisation. Commitments outlined in the assessment include "*increasing the resilience of the region's manufacturing base, including its (currently) relatively carbon intensive foundation industries*". Alongside this, we note the Council has recently adopted the new South-West Wales Regional Economic Delivery Plan as its strategic framework for economic regeneration, which includes commitment to making the economy resilient to climate change and acting on decarbonisation, and aiming to establish South West Wales as a UK leader in renewable energy and the development of a net zero economy.

The assessment includes reference to recent and ongoing developments within Swansea, by consistently linking findings to the policy and strategic context. Good examples include:

- Reference to Swansea's application to the Foundational Economy Challenge Fund to test out two new approaches to the design and procurement of services in rural areas of Swansea.
- Embedding findings from NRW's Area Statement for South-West Wales.
- Swansea's Corporate Parenting Strategy 'best life' project.
- The Skills and Talent Project, from the City Deal.

It's great to see the 'Recognising and Respecting Children's Rights' feature highlighting Swansea as the first local authority in the UK to voluntarily make a public commitment to Children's Rights, and the 'Listening to Children and Young People' section within the 'social' chapter is a strength of the assessment. There is rich information in the key issues they have highlighted for your PSB to consider and reflect upon, such as protecting the environment, supporting disabled children, equality for LGBTQ+ children and young people, and developing resources to help young people better understand politics.

We note Swansea's evening and night-time economy (ENTE) has a reputation nationally as a leading light in how the sector should be managed, and it's positive to hear of your response to calls to improve safety for people, in particular women and other vulnerable groups, when visiting the city centre by day and after dark.

The chapter on environmental well-being is comprehensive, with consideration given to the key legislation, strategies and policies in place. It's particularly positive to see a focus on food within the 'Soils, land use and food' section of the assessment, which includes sharing the example from a survey that found 94% of 183 respondents in Swansea would consider joining a CSA veg box scheme, and sharing key messages from the 'Food for the Region' conference. We also note the section indicates a recommendation to pursue a food strategy for Swansea.

The draft assessment also includes a strong chapter on cultural well-being. It's great to hear about the new 'Diversity Pledge for Culture' in the city, which represents a commitment to diversification of audiences, and support to ensure communities with protected characteristics have fair and equal representation and access to your programming. We also note Swansea is signed up to Culture 21 (Agenda 21 for Culture) within the European cohort, and were the first UK city to do so.

3: Areas that could be further developed

Important areas for consideration

There is much to be commended on your work and approach to the draft well-being assessment. Building on the extensive work already undertaken, below are areas we consider to be important for your consideration. If developed further, they would help strengthen the assessment overall.

Key messages

We note reference to the academic research the PSB has commissioned to highlight the key implications and messages (the 'so what') from the draft well-being assessment.

While this is positive to hear, it's not clear from the information set out if these findings would be included in the final well-being assessment, or if this is intended as information aimed at PSB members to help inform next steps as attention shifts to the well-being plan? Clarity on this within the assessment would be helpful. We would also be interested to see the findings of the work.

Involvement

Your approach to involvement is helpfully detailed within annex 1 of the draft assessment. This outlines the three key phases of the work: an online survey; working with partners to make the most of existing events and opportunities; and the consultation process of the draft assessment itself. Annex 1 also provides a helpful overview of the responses, set out in relation to the four dimensions of well-being.

It's reassuring to hear "the level and quality of response was encouraging" to your survey in autumn 2021 and your "approach aims to ensure that gaps are identified and seldom heard from voices considered." The 'Listening to Children and Young People' section within the 'social' chapter is a strength of the assessment and we note the comment that a priority for the PSB is meaningful and inclusive opportunities for children and young people to be heard in decisions that affect them.

Similarly, the Ageing Well Steering Group used a range of methods for engaging people 50+ in an effort to increase accessibility and uptake of the consultation, to which 236 responses were received which highlighted some of the key issues they wish to work on to make Swansea a better place to live. It's also good to see the social care section (under 'social') state that the priority is to ensure co-production remains central to the planning, design and delivery of services.

Building on your positive work to date, we encourage you to consider including further information (and reflection) on the following:

- What you consider to be the strengths and challenges of your engagement work to date.
- Identifying the 'seldom heard voices' you are seeking to involve.
- Any approaches or tools you've identified that could potentially improve your work to involve people going forward.
- Using and including quotes from residents within the assessment (we note annex 1 states these will be included in the final published assessment).

Using and adopting strong, innovative involvement techniques that go beyond engagement and move more towards co-production is important for all PSBs. To help inform the next stages of the well-being planning process, the Co-production Network for Wales is producing advice and guidance based on the way in which involvement and co-production has been embedded in the well-being process so far. We encourage your PSB teams and coordinators to help shape this guidance with Co-Production Network for Wales, as it develops.

Future Trends

While the draft assessment provides a comprehensive overview of well-being in the area, we acknowledge your statement that this is an early draft, and the Future Trends Report is yet to be fully considered.

As currently set out, it is helpful the structure of the draft assessment includes a 'Future Trends and Prospects for Swansea' section for (most of) the topics that fall under each dimension of well-being, and there is valuable information contained within some of these sections. Data on longer-term demographics aside, the environment chapter is perhaps the strongest in looking longer-term, due in part to the challenges faced by the climate and nature emergency, and how that links directly to challenges such as ecosystem resilience, water resources, flood risk etc.

Building on the structure you have adopted for the draft assessment, we recommend full consideration is given to the <u>Future Trends Report</u> (published in December 2021) to help better inform and strengthen the assessment. This should be carried out in relation to and across all four dimensions of well-being.

Looking ahead, it would also be helpful to understand how the PSB intends to continue to consider and embed future trends information into its next steps, including the development of a well-being plan and setting of objectives and steps. Futures techniques are effective tools for engaging with others and prompting constructive discussion in a way that can help develop plans that deliver meaningful change.

In their feedback to PSBs, NRW are offering to run Three Horizons workshop to help support the incorporation of future trends into the well-being planning process. We encourage your PSB to take up this offer if you haven't already. Our Three Horizons toolkit is available <u>here</u>.

Skills for the future

There is good information contained within the 'Swansea's workforce' section and it's positive to hear the Council and its local/regional partners are working to create a more skilled workforce in the future. This includes sharing examples of several initiatives, including the recently approved Skills and Talent project under the Swansea Bay City Deal, which will work to develop skills in the region, plugging the skills gaps in many sectors.

With the ongoing and forthcoming regeneration projects including Copr Bay, The Kingsway and Blue Eden projects in mind, and the continued growth of the city's two universities, we encourage you to consider the findings in our <u>recent report</u> on the skills needed to transition to a low carbon economy. It finds that across Wales there are significant skills gaps in green industries which must be addressed.

This could be explored further within the 'Future trends and prospects for Swansea' area of the 'Swansea workforce' section and in relation to the discussion of school attainment and training and education provision in the region. Clear links should also be made to your local Regional Skills Partnership.

Equality

The draft assessment is strong in its consideration of equality. Examples of good practice includes the discussion of domestic violence and its consideration of different identities (and changing statistics). For example, *"The percentage of BAME cases referred to MARAC has remained in the region of 6.6% and 7.4% since 2018 with less than 1% fluctuation year on year. However, the*

specialist advice service for BAME victims saw a significant drop in numbers from 2018 to 2021, possibly correlating to the lack of outreach events due to the pandemic."

Other examples highlighted include Swansea being the first local authority area in Wales to set up a Poverty Truth Commission and the Council passing a motion expressing its solidarity with BAME communities in Swansea and across the world in their fight for justice, which also committed the Council to celebrating and memorialising a greater range of Swansea's citizens of the past, particularly women, BAME, disabled, LGBT and working-class people. Swansea has also been a City of Sanctuary since 2010 and an asylum seeker dispersal area since 2001. In the culture chapter, the assessment also discusses engagement with the Black Lives Matter movement in the summer of 2020, alongside events and celebrations such as LGBT+ month and Diwali.

The assessment also provides a thorough analysis and exploration of crime in Swansea, covering a wide range of topics which includes: Violence Against Women, Domestic Abuse and Sexual Violence; substance misuse; street vulnerability; evening and night time economy; hate crime; community cohesion and wildfires.

We acknowledge the assessment highlights existing gaps. Building on the positive work undertaken to date, we recommend:

- Ensuring all '<u>protected characteristics</u>' outlined in the Equality Act are considered within the assessment.
- Some consideration is given to how intersectionality affects people in the area. For example, what is like to be young and LGBTQ+ in Swansea? We note in the 'Listening to young people' section, children and young people highlighted 'Equality for LGBTQ+ children and young people' as a key issue.
- Making the links to your engagement work on engaging with seldom heard voices, as this develops.

We also encourage you to consider the implications of our recent '<u>Inequality in a future Wales</u>' report. This highlights the how future of work, changing demographics and climate change could increase existing inequalities if the impacts on different groups in society are not factored in.

Maximising the PSB's contribution to Wales' well-being goals

Understanding the full definition of Wales' well-being goals can help ensure the assessment is considering the wide range of topics and themes of well-being within your area.

The table below sets out areas that could be explored further within the assessment, and/or taken into consideration for the well-being plan.

It is appreciated that it may not be possible for all the information below to be fully considered / incorporated in your assessment. Instead, you may wish to choose some areas to compliment the extensive work you have already undertaken:

Welsh Language	The draft assessment provides strong consideration of the Welsh
	language. This includes key statistics, cultural initiatives and events in the
	area, making the links to Cymraeg 2050 and the important role Swansea
	played in the history of Welsh language and culture: "The Welsh Language
	owes much to the history of Swansea; the deep roots of the language and
	it's literature can be traced back beyond the medieval period through
	Welsh language poets and their patrons".

	As the PSB's attention shifts to the well-being plan, we recommend clear links are made to your local authority's promotional strategy and your relevant Welsh in Education Strategic Plan (WESP).
Fair and local	The assessment acknowledges "Local sourcing of goods and services by
procurement	residents, businesses and public sector plays an important role in both supporting the local economy and reducing environmental impact." Our bitesize resource on procurement provides a helpful summary on the Commissioner's vision for procurement, identifying the key issues highlighted by public bodies during the research and Section 20 Review, as well as the recommendations outlined in our 'Procuring well-being in Wales' report.
Brexit	Likely to have an impact for Swansea and its residents, e.g., EU citizens residing in the city, the ability of businesses to import and export goods, and sectors such as tourism and the creative industries that have relied on free movement of people. The WCPP's briefing: <u>'The impacts of Covid-19</u> and Brexit on well-being' is a helpful resource on this.
Regional Skills	It's not clear if the links have been made with your local Regional Skills
Partnership	Partnership. Your assessment will be a significant resource for them.
	Similarly, their strategies and priorities will be key for your PSB. Please
	also see above points on skills for the future.

Other areas for consideration (desirable)

These are areas you might wish to amend / update to strengthen the assessment overall:

- Localised data: The draft assessment provides some breakdown of data to smaller geographies within Swansea, but this could be more consistent through the document (where possible to do so). Comparison of different areas can be helpful to highlight local inequalities, any best practice from programmes delivered at a local level, and to identify where targeted interventions may be required.
- Integration: A strong feature of the assessment which recognises many issues are interconnected. Structuring a well-being assessment by well-being dimension does works well but there are some sections where clearer links could be made to other areas/chapters of the assessment. For example, the chapter on poverty is extensive and includes fuel and food poverty, and further links could be made here to the environment and economy chapters. Similarly, while integration is discussed in relation to digital connectivity where it states: *"there are also links to aspects of the social chapter, including housing and poverty"*, it would be helpful in examples like this if some further information/context could be provided on how this is the case.
- **Collaboration:** Building on the collaborative approach taken to developing the assessment in the region, it would be beneficial if the assessment identified *who* all the partners were and *how* the collaboration was managed. This information would help for future learning, as cross-sector collaboration is a challenging but often effective means of delivering social change.
- **Overall conclusions:** The 'economy' chapter finishes with a section on 'Overall Conclusions'. For consistency, you may wish to include a similar section in the other three main chapters.
- Net Zero: The environment chapter refers to Welsh Government's Low Carbon Delivery Plan (Prosperity for All, 2019). Please note, this document has been updated and replaced with '<u>Net Zero</u>'.

Minor considerations

There are a few minor considerations with formatting you may wish to address for the final assessment:

- The subheading 'adult social care' is the same as the topic heading 'social care'. This could be made clearer.
- Links to the sub-topics where they are listed in the introductory chapter would be beneficial and increase navigability.
- Reference not included properly on page 151. Similarly, text for 'insert image' remains on page 201.

4: Resources to help inform your next steps

Below are resources that can help inform your next steps, as you move from well-being assessment to well-being plan:

- Chapter 4 of the Future Generations Report: 'Setting Good Well-being Objectives'
- The 'Future Generations Framework for Projects'
- <u>Case studies</u> of how the Act is being implemented on the ground in Wales
- Office of the Future Generations Commissioner for Wales: <u>Resources</u>

Atodiad 4 – Ymateb Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru

18th March 2022

Dear Councillor Lewis, Chair of Swansea Public Services Board

Well-being Assessment Consultation Response from NRW

Thank you for providing us with the opportunity to respond formally to the Swansea Well-being Assessment. In order to provide targeted and co-ordinated support to all of our Public Services Boards, we have arranged our feedback into the following categories:

- (i) Items which are special or significant and distinct to place
- (ii) Assessment and analysis of Environmental Well-being
- (iii) Future trends
- (iv) Application of the Climate Change Risk Assessment for Wales (CCRA3)
- (v) Inequalities between communities and exposure to environmental risk

Beneath each heading we have considered our recommendations for the assessment, our aspirations for future development of the well-being plan and the NRW contribution to all of the above as an integral partner in the Well-being planning process.

The above categories have been drawn from <u>Welsh Government's Statutory</u> <u>guidance (SPSF3)</u> on the collective role of Public Services Boards. NRW will use these categories in combination with the framework for assessing Environmental Well-being provided by <u>SoNaRR2020</u> to inform all of our consultation responses. Where applicable, we will also draw on local information and evidence gathered as part of our Area Statements. For more information on how we will use this information and that which lies behind the categories listed below please refer to the attached briefing note: Well-being Planning Framework for Approval.

NRW will aim to provide formal written feedback on PSB products at three separate intervals during the development of Well-being Plans. This will include this round of Well-being Assessment consultation, again following the development of draft Well-being objectives, and for one final time during Well-being plan Consultation.

Each stage will allow NRW to involve as wide a range of technical specialists as possible within our own organisation. The process will also provide the NRW board with a documented story of Well-being Plan development in each place. This will be invaluable to them at the end of the process when they are looking to sign off each individual Well-being Plan.

Please contact your local PSB rep for information about next steps and NRW involvement.

Yours sincerely

Martyn Evans

Head of Operations South West Wales

Tel: 07468 742564

Direct e-mail: <u>martyn.p.evans@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u>

NRW Well-being Assessment Consultation for Swansea Public Service Board

1. Items which are special or significant and distinct to place

Findings: Meeting Expected

It is clear, particularly through key strategies and commitments supported by well-established as well as emerging / newer partnerships, that Swansea has many strengths and assets to call upon to respond swiftly to the growing challenges of climate change and biodiversity decline, and other environmental risks that impact well-being in Swansea now, and those which are predicted to intensify in future. This is reflected well throughout the document and in all chapters.

Overall, the Environment chapter of the draft Well-being Assessment does well in presenting information, data, and evidence to reflect the significance and value of Swansea's natural environment. However, *reference/s to natural resources* and the risks, impacts and opportunities associated with them *across all well-being dimensions could be more spatially specific* to better reflect important differences, inequalities, and the range of challenges and responses needed. Doing so will better inform and aid subsequent discussions and priority setting, helping ensure resources are committed where they are most needed for a green and just future. If adding this information to the final version of the assessment is not possible within timescales, it would be helpful to note that this will be sought and brought into discussions regards well-being plan objectives and priorities. A particular theme we would encourage the PSB to explore spatially is that of equality of access to and use of high quality, natural green and blue space, and equality of access to active and sustainable travel.

In addition to environmental well-being, our natural assets deliver preventative, cost-effective, and long-term nature-based solutions to some of our most complex social, economic, and cultural needs, e.g., preventative and therapeutic health interventions, and addressing socio-economic inequalities, a regenerative and net-zero economy. 'Integration' is a Topic sub-heading within each chapter and this has helped raise awareness and focus minds on making linkages within / between chapters and topics. It is recommended that the Assessment and evolving well-being planning process looks builds on these high-level linkages to ensure that well-being is considered 'in the round', key cross-curtting themes are identified, and the ground is paved for meaningful collaboration to tackle issues such as transformation of the food, energy, and transportation systems. In the absence of time to fully explore these, it would be helpful for the Assessment to commit the PSB to exploring the opportunities and conflicts / challenges of cross-cutting themes to inform the next phases of the Well-being planning process.

It is particularly heartening to see that young people (in response to a consultation exercise) have as their number one priority, 'Protecting the Environment and Green Spaces' (*ref Social Chapter, Listening to Children and Young People: Perceptions and Perspectives*); it will be paramount to ensure these conversations are continued with support for YP to be involved in decision-making about their future in Swansea particularly around this theme. Perhaps the PSB's Human Rights City Steering Group may be in a position to take this forward? If timings allow, it would be good to include any feedback from NRW and WG's Natur a Ni project that has been received from people living / working in Swansea. We will be happy to coordinate this with our colleagues.

	Recommendations for the Assessment	Aspirations for future Well-being Plan development	NRW Contributions
a re n b ir	To set the scene and give important context from the start of this key assessment, and as Swansea's outstanding natural environment is a major part of the county's identity and a big draw to visitors, a 'Place Profile' giving a more detailed overview of landscape and natural assets could be added following the 'Demographic Profile' chapter that is already included. <i>NRW is happy to provide draft text for this</i> – <i>see Appendix A</i> . In the Cultural chapter, page 197, it is noted that, "Swansea's key strength is its unique mix of city, coast and country offer within one destination. With award winning and globally recognised beaches, parks with green flag status and Britain's first Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, it is important to recognise the vital role the natural environment plays in boosting residents and visitors wellbeing."	As we move forwards into the well- being planning phase the assessment provides a good basis for PSB partners to consider in greater depth the factors and cross-cutting issues which are distinct to Swansea including the direct reliance on natural assets. Doing so will help us ensure the risks to and opportunities for our natural resources are recognised and better understood by stakeholders, and their maintenance, management, improvement and / or protection be appropriately resourced to improve the wellbeing of current as well as future generations. Linkages to be explored with NPT (and other?) PSBs, and within the context of the economically and culturally significant Swansea Bay City Region. The current joint consultancy exercise between Swansea and NPT may provide a good opportunity for this exploring links between these two areas.	NRW has offered the PSB an opportunity to be involved in hosting a focus group to jointly explore what citizens want for the future of the natural environment and the actions we can all take to safeguard it. This would form part of the national conversation (Natur a Ni / Nature and Us) being hosted by NRW with support from Welsh Government. The results of this focus group, together with the outputs from the national conversation specific to your PSB area, can be woven into longer- term planning through the development of the Well-being Plan." Please contact <u>NaturaNi@cyfoethnaturiolcymru.gov.uk</u> for more information about this offer. This is a central team who will work closely with your regional contacts to ensure that we are complementing and not diverting resources away from ongoing activity. Contact has been made with the Natur a Ni team, and participants invited from Swansea, with some further activity planned. Results from conversations in Swansea will be shared with the PSB in due course.

2. Assessment and analysis of Environmental Well-being

Findings: Meeting expected

The Environment chapter provides a good summation of local and national data and evidence as they relate to environmental well-being in Swansea, and this detail is reinforced by remarks relating to climate change and natural resources throughout other chapters. For example, the positive reference to beaches and parks / green space as important natural assets for cultural and economic well-being, particulary tourism, but also as an amenity that innately enhances well-being. However, this could be strengthened by considering the risks / challenges and future trends for these assets and knock-on effects (the 'so what?') for longer-term and sustainable cultural and economic well-being.

Data sets are contextualised by using corresponding and complementary evidence from a range of sources including Water Framework Directive data, Climate Change Risk Assessment 3 (CCRA3) report, information and data on SINC condition, Local Nature Recovery Action Plan data and evidence, SW Area Statement, and SoNaRR 2020. Although use of this evidence is, in the main, limited to the Environment chapter, it should be noted that the findings of these key reports, particularly SoNaRR, CCRA3, and Area Statements are relevant to all aspects of well-being.

As well as details on current and planned regeneration / development activity in Swansea, references to natural resources, in particular to climate change, decarbonisation, and green infrastructure, are made in the Economic chapter. In the next phase of the well-being planning process, this discussion could perhaps go further and ask itself the 'so what' question - what / how the the programme of regeneration will, for example, embed and respond to the need to adapt and mitigate for climate change in the longer-term, including implications for flood risk areas, and enabling active and sustainable travel into the city centre and other key employment hubs, attractions, and facilities.

High-level linkages are made between environmental and other dimensions of well-being in all chapters, which help highlight further discussions around opportunity for cross-partner collaborations.

It is noted that the Environment chapter rightly states the **climate and nature emergencies as being interwoven** and that they must be addressed together, and reference to this is made throughout the chapter. The assessment also includes information on the risks to environmental well-being, including competing land use, habitat loss and degradation, climate change, water quality and quantity, etc. The risks are multiple and relevant to all other dimensions of well-being. A broader and more integrated analysis of the social and economic drivers of sustainable natural resource management (aims three and four of SoNaRR2020) would be beneficial to make sure the PSB is **tackling the root cause of issues that are driving unsustainable management**.

Due to the acknowledged gap on (mental and physical) health in the Social section, there has not been opportunity to identify and discuss the **significant links between health and natural resources**, particularly active travel, air and water quality, access to green and blue space, flood risk, GI, etc... although there is mention of these associations within topics under the Environment chapter. We would welcome opportunity to work with PSB partners to input to health topics and / or **provide some narrative to acknowledge these important links** and commit to exploring them in the development of objective and priority setting for the Well-being Plan.

Recommendations	Aspirations	NRW Contributions
Include narrative and refs to	Since the last round of Well-being planning, there have been a number	Depending on the interest of PSB
case studies / relevant research	of significant shifts in public discussion and understanding in relation to	partners, NRW would welcome the
and policy on links between	the environment, climate change, and natural resources in Wales. The	opportunity to develop our shared
health and natural resources,	overwhelming message from SoNaRR is that societal	understanding of how collective
and nature-based solutions for	transformation is needed in the Food, Energy and Mobility	interventions may shape
health and well-being.	systems, which are referred to within the assessment. The	transformation in the food, energy
	connections between all four dimensions of well-being are being made	and transport systems as
	apparent in the playing out of everyday events, writ large during Covid	recommended by SoNaRR2020.
	and, now, with fuel, energy, and food supply and pricing being	For an introductory overview
	impacted, and recent inflation not seen for decades. So, it is important	please see:
	to consider environmental well-being in this integrated way so that	<u>SoNaRR2020 Main messages</u>
	we can ensure we are acting for the longer term and tackling the root	<u> Video - Welsh subtitles</u>
	cause of issues that are contributing towards the climate and nature	
	emergencies.	
	Accompanying this is an increasing appreciation of the need for co-	
	ordinated public sector responses. As the Public Services Board	
	moves from well-being assessment and into the response analysis	
	phase, it will be important to identify how collaborative public sector	
	working can drive transformation in the food, energy and	
	transport sectors and identify what levers we have locally that can	
	help shape and drive this transformation for the benefit of current and	
	future generations.	

3. Future Trends

Findings: Meeting expected

Under the 'Future Trends' sub-heading in each topic section, reference to future trends is made throughout the document indicating that consideration of them and their potential impact on well-being in Swansea has been made. The Environment chapter does this well particularly with reference to, and within the context of, the inherently longer timescales and timelags associated with climate change and biodiversity decline, and where there is much research and policy to refer to. However, in some other sections the **draft narrative could be strengthened by analysing the implications of the findings of the Future Trends Wales report** to greater depth.

As part of the response analysis and ongoing discussions leading to the next stage of the well-being planning process, it may be helpful to **draw out common 'challenges' or risks that should be addressed collectively through a futures thinking exercise**, which may help to identify joint priorities and objectives for the next well-being plan. Greater detail from more in-depth consultation and engagement with partners and stakeholders about potential future scenarios should provide additional, and in some cases more meaningful, insights as to how PSB partners could respond to any of the predicted future trends.

NRW would like to work with PSB partners to jointly review the future trend analysis over the remainder of the well-being planning process.

Recommendations	Aspirations	NRW Contributions
With reference to Future Trends Wales report, build-on the draft narrative to draw out and add details across chapters / topics, as are relevant to Swansea.	As the PSB moves forward into response analysis it will be important to make sure that we work extensively with a wide range of partners and stakeholders to collaborate and co-produce an analysis of the "possible" future trends and their potential impact on Swansea. This work should include demonstrating the use of multiple relevant futures resources such as Go-Science UK trend deck, Future Trends Wales Report, plus things like private sector scenarios and other sources as needed. NRW would like to support the PSB to use future trends tools and resources to produce multiple scenarios and/or options for delivery. This work should help inform ongoing decision making at the PSB.	NRW would like to offer to run a 'Three Horizons' workshop, to help support the incorporation of future trends into the next phase of well- being planning.

4. Application of the Climate Change Risk Assessment for Wales (CCRA3)

Findings: Meeting Expected

Climate change, and associated risks or impacts, is mentioned many times throughout the document, and there is important acknowledgement that both the Climate and Nature Emergencies are inter-related challenges which cannot be tackled in isolation. The assessment contains narrative on climate change risk and impacts at a high-level, although does detail those communities at a greater level of flood risk. There is opportunity and need to enhance this assessment and its usefulness in informing further discussions through more detailed assessment of potential impacts on key assets, including infrastructure, protected areas/habitats, and communities. This could be done by identifying, as relevant across all four well-being dimensions, those risks which the Climate Change Risk Assessment **3 (CCRA3) Welsh summary report lists as high magnitude and requiring action now**, and what they mean for specific communities and aspects of well-being.

Recommendations	Aspirations	NRW Contributions
 Include in the document, where most relevant, responses regards climate change that were received through well-being assessment survey, engagement activities, and consultation, particularly lived experience. 	As the PSB moves forward into response analysis it will be important to undertake analysis (even if only qualitative) of all the CCRA3 risks relevant to the PSB area, and to better understand the degree to which they are already recognised and mitigated. Any	NRW would like to support the PSB to analyse climate risks and opportunities as they relate specifically to Swansea. NRW would also like to
 Add / update narrative with reference to the latest findings of the IPCC 6th Assessment report: 	place specific local risks should be identified. The PSB should detail potential impacts on communities and infrastructure along with	continue to support and actively participate in development and
 "The cumulative scientific evidence is unequivocal: Climate change is a threat to human well-being and planetary health. Any further delay in concerted anticipatory global action on adaptation and mitigation will miss a brief and rapidly closing window of opportunity to secure a liveable and sustainable future for all." IPCC Sixth Assessment Report, 2022 It is recommended to also refer to: The Climate and Nature charter 	impacts on habitats. To do this, it will be important to set out risk management approaches and opportunities to adapt to risks, such as opportunities for nature-based solutions to support coastal adaptation. The PSB should also set out opportunities for engagement with affected communities to enable delivery of the measures or at least to develop an approach for this. For all those risks relevant Swansea a	subsequent delivery of a climate strategy for Swansea.

climate change topic although, ideally, this should be addressed across and by all dimensions of well-being. those risks.)
--

5. Inequalities between communities and exposure to environmental risk

Findings: Developing

The well-being assessment explores inequalities between different demographic groups and communities in Swansea mainly from a social and economic perspective. Although this provides critically important insights, environmental inequalities resulting from different levels of exposure to environmental risks are only partially addressed. The links between all well-being dimensions and their causal relationships on inequalities are not fully considered and therefore remain unclear. A more integrated perspective and understanding of this topic should be developed as this would generate valuable additional insights.

Recommendations	Aspirations	NRW Contributions
Refer to and include, where relevant, findings and recommendations from the FGC for Wales report: <u>Inequality in a</u> <u>Future Wales: Areas for action in work,</u> <u>climate and demographic change</u> . This may help highlight priority areas (topical, soci-economic, spatial) in	As the PSB moves forward into response analysis it will be important to identify environmental and socio- economic inequalities between and within communities. This would include reference to specific communities which are more vulnerable to environmental risks and hazards. This includes but is not limited to flood risk,	 NRW would like to support the PSB to develop a more integrated understanding of inequalities in Swansea and to explore nature-based solutions to alleviate certain aspects and manifestations of inequalities. Our support could include: Online training webinar to support PSB to link health, education, and nature.

Swansea for further discussion.	poor air quality, noise pollution, water quality (water supply and bathing waters: public health impact) and INNS (public health impact). The PSB should work together to evidence an understanding and analysis of the socio-economic demographics of the communities within Swansea, e.g., poor water quality areas should be identifying the socio-economic impacts on people and communities. Further data sets such as the <u>Welsh</u> <u>Information for Nature-based Solutions</u> could also be referenced to highlight some of the potential opportunities to tackle inequalities arising from different levels of exposure to environmental risks and benefits within the PSB area	 NRW Health Impact Assessment (HIA) guidance and tools to support integrated thinking about natural resources and health, for example a training session on Wider Determinants of Health and outline of HIA with focus on environment. Use of the Welsh Information for Nature-based Solutions' (WINS) data and maps to identify priority areas for nature-based solutions to air quality, pluvial flooding, noise pollution and access to green space. This data combines environmental mapping, population density and deprivation to identify priority areas for nature- based solutions. It is a good example of how to tackle health and wider inequalities.
---------------------------------	--	---

Please also see Appendix A for further suggestions of text amendments or additions that may enable the relevant linkages and cross references across chapters/themes.

Appendix A

• Proposed text for section on Swansea's landscape following 'Demographic Profile' on page10.

The Gower peninsula is renowned for its scenic quality, particularly the coastline and prominent open hills such as Rhossili Down and Cefn Bryn, its attractive sea and coastal views and strong sense of place. A large part is designated as an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB), the UK's first. The Swansea area has spectacular geology and geomorphology, which is internationally important, with 20 geological Sites of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI), 9 regionally important geological and geomorphological sites (RIGs) and more. The well-visited south Gower coast is indented, with rocky cliffs, headlands and sandy bays backed by dunes; the coastline of north Gower is noted for its broad estuarine marshes, part of the internationally important Carmarthen Bay and Estuaries Special Area of Conservation and boasts views across the Loughor estuary. Inland Gower has open rolling farmland fields and hedges with picturesque and tranquil rural villages. Historic interest is evident throughout rural Gower, including the medieval field system of the Vile at Rhossili and prehistoric features of the uplands. Gower is extremely important for coastal recreation, including surfing, sailing, and swimming and for walking along the coast and uplands. Tourism, in particular camping and caravan parks feature strongly. Around the edges of Swansea, commons, small wooded valleys and farmland provide opportunities for walking, cycling and horse riding. Crymlyn Bog is a nationally important nature reserve, and parkland and forest at Penllergaer provide informal recreation. Away from the M4 corridor, these areas can be peaceful. Mumbles Head and the sweeping beach of Swansea Bay define the city's coast and provide the focus for coastal recreation, walking and cycling routes. Open upland rolling hills and valleys dominate the northern part of the area, with extensive views over Carmarthenshire and the Black Mountain. The uplands are also important areas for recreation. Settlements, woodland, and pasture dominate the valleys, which are important routes for walking and cycling, often associated with historic infrastructure such as canals and disused railways as in the Tawe Valley.

• Recommended adjustments in Cultural chapter:

In the Cultural chapter, page 197, it is noted that, "Swansea's key strength is its unique mix of city, coast and country offer within one destination. With award winning and globally recognised beaches, parks with green flag status and Britain's first Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, it is important to recognise the vital role the natural environment plays in boosting residents and visitors wellbeing."

Recommendation: The above statement to acknowledge that Swansea's natural resources and resilience are at risk from overuse, the climate and nature emergencies, and these risks are likely to become more challenging to address if not done so now, impacting the sustainability of the tourism offer and benefits to local economic wellbeing.

Climate Change – Cultural Heritage

The effects of Climate change will be felt across society, including by our built and tangible heritage assets. The relevant risks and opportunities are outlined in the third UK Climate Change Risk Assessment (CCRA3).

The main current risks to cultural heritage relate to extreme weather fluctuations including increasing temperatures (heatwaves or fires), precipitation and flooding, coastal processes, and from unintended consequences of climate mitigation and adaptation measures within the heritage sector and across other sectors. In particular, coastal heritage sites are at threat from a combination of hazards; sea level rise leading to increased flooding and coastal erosion; driving rain and landscape character changes.

Examples of how climate related pressures impact heritage assets include waterlogging of archaeological sites, damp problems and water ingress issues at historic properties, changes in groundwater levels affecting historic gardens, new pest species threatening heritage landscapes, damage to assets caused by wildfires and flooding and heat risks to collections and archives. It is important that we are of these risks and put in place preventative measures to protect our heritage assets where we can.

However, it is inevitable that we will not be able to save all our assets. Risk management of cultural heritage sites may need to include consultation and engagement with affected communities to accept inevitable loss of heritage sites to climate change hazards.

While our cultural heritage faces large risk from climate change, there are some potential opportunities for cultural heritage through the indirect effects of climate change, such as rising temperatures leading to increased visitor footfall and boosting the local economy. Although we must also recognise that increased visitors can also lead to erosion of heritage sites.

• Recommended additional narrative for Economic chapter:

Circular Economy and Covid 19

We know that in Wales we are not using our natural resources sustainably. If everyone consumed the same amount of resources as we do in Wales, then we would need two and a half planets to support us. The consequences of this overshoot are already being felt in the shape of climate change and biodiversity decline. In response, the Welsh Government has set out its ambitions for a circular economy, supporting a green and just recovery, in its <u>Beyond Recycling</u> strategy.

A circular economy keeps resources and materials in use for as long as possible and avoids all waste. This will mean moving away from a 'linear economy' which assumes a constant supply of natural resources or the take-make-use-dispose culture based on the extraction of resources, the production of goods and services, and the disposal of post-consumer waste.

The circular economy offers an approach which can work to reduce consumption. Taking a circular economy approach is a key pillar of a green and just recovery, helping not only to address the climate and nature crisis, but also driving better and more equitable economic outcomes for Wales.

We already have a strong foundation for a circular economy here in Wales, with a strong track record in recycling. Wales is a world leader when it comes to recycling and is currently ranked third best in the world. The Welsh Government's £1 billion investment since devolution in household recycling has helped see recycling rates increase from just 4.8% in 1998-1999, to over 65% in 2020-21. This high rate of household recycling in Wales saves over 400,000 tonnes of CO2 per year from being released into the atmosphere and is a key contribution to tackling the climate and nature emergencies.

We have learned a lot through the Covid-19 pandemic, our recovery from which represents a once in a generation opportunity to reset our individual and collective values and priorities, realigning them with those required to create a more sustainable future. The consensus across Wales, UK, Europe and beyond is that recovery from Covid-19 must address the underlying nature and climate emergencies. The calls for individuals, businesses, governments and global institutions to refocus and accelerate the response to the pandemic along a pathway which both restores nature and decarbonises our economy have been increasing in strength. This integrated approach would consider nature and climate together as the foundation of economic, social and political renewal and regeneration in Wales, reflecting the focus of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015.

It would be helpful also to include reference to the suite of projects under Swansea Bay City Deal that contribute to the low carbon / net zero ambitions of the region, in particular Homes as Power Stations, Supporting Innovation and Low Carbon Growth, Skills and Talent.